

**REPORT FOR CONSIDERATION AT PLANNING COMMITTEE**

<b>Reference No:</b> HGY/2011/0998	<b>Ward:</b> Highgate
<b>Address:</b> 225 Archway Road N6 5BS	
<b>Proposal:</b> Demolition of 1940s extensions to listed villa & replacement with new single storey extension, repairs to fabric and re-planning of interior; extension of terrace to Archway Road. Provision of new bicycle store and recycling area; removal of specified trees and planting new trees, with new hard and soft landscape.	
<b>Existing Use:</b> Residential	<b>Proposed Use:</b> Residential
<b>Applicant:</b> MsLissa Napolitano Loromah Estates	
<b>Ownership:</b> Private	
<b>Date received:</b> 27/05/2011 <b>Last amended date:</b> DD/MM/YYYY	
<b>Drawing number of plans:</b> S12 PLA PP3 100, 101, 102, 103, 105, 501, 502, 505, 520, 550 & 560	
<b>Case Officer Contact:</b> Matthew Gunning	
<b>PLANNING DESIGNATIONS:</b> Listed Building, Conservation Area. Restricted Conversion Area, Road Network: Classified Road	
<b>RECOMMENDATION:</b> GRANT PERMISSION subject to conditions and subject to sec. 106 Legal Agreement	
<b>SUMMARY OF REPORT:</b> The current application follows on from a previously refused scheme, which is very similar to the current application, but differs in that it removes the proposal for a two-storey house with lower ground floor, which would have fronted onto Cholmeley Park. The proposal will involve alterations, minor extensions and refurbishment of the existing Grade II, which currently contains 5 self contained flats, and the erection of a new building to the side of 227 Archway Road to be read as an extension to the terrace to accommodate 4 self contained flats (1 x 1 bed unit and 3 x 2 bed). The proposed extension to the Archway Road terrace in terms of its position, form, design and appearance, will have a satisfactory relationship with the listed building and will not adversely affect the residential and visual amenities of adjoining occupiers. The four new residential units to front onto Archway Road will be secured to be 'car free' (by way of a S106 agreement) and as such the proposal will not adversely affect parking conditions in the immediate surroundings. This application is therefore recommended for APPROVAL	

## 1. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 1.1 No 225 Archway is a detached two storey; Grade II C19 listed building located on a large corner plot (0.18 ha in size) at the junction of Archway Road and Cholmeley Park. Its frontage features an ionic portico, a 3 windows wide frontage with a further two storey two window wide wing to the right stepped slightly forward. The building is faced in pale grey brickwork with brickwork quoins and has gauged yellow brick arches with keystones to recessed sash windows with margin lights. The building has a low pitched slated roof with long moulded brackets to the eaves soffit. The building sits back from the road and is set on a raised level on the site amongst trees. The grounds to the front and rear of building are heavily overgrown and contain a number of mature trees. None of the trees on site are protected however they are important to the character and appearance of the conservation area. The building on site has been converted into five self contained flats.
- 1.2 The site falls within the extensive Highgate Conservation Area; which is largely residential in character, with terraces of houses on streets to the west and east of Archway Road. These terrace houses are substantial Victorian terraces with good proportions and strongly consistent detailing with vertical emphasis to front elevations.
- 1.3 Archway Road itself is a very busy arterial road that has been designated as a Priority (Red) Route. It is generally densely developed, with a mixture of residential and commercial properties along each side of the road. Many of the properties along Archway Road and on the streets to the east and west of this arterial route have been converted into flats. The application site falls within the Archway Road Restricted Conversion Area. The application site is approximately 500m away from Highgate Tube Station.

## 2. PROPOSAL

- 2.1 The proposal is for extensions, alterations and improvement to the listed building to create five flats (2 x 1 bed & 3 x 2 bed units)); the extension of the terrace to Archway Road to accommodate 4 self contained flats.

## 3. PLANNING HISTORY

OLD/1965/0019 - Demolition of existing house – Approved 10/03/1965

05/09/1955 - The continuance of display of advertisement in modified form – Refused 05/08/1952

OLD/1955/0450 - A proposed petrol filling station on Archway Road frontage - Refused 05/09/1955

OLD/1973/1270 - Erection of block of flats. (Revocation & other papers with reference no. 1030/225/5 5312) - Withdrawn 22/05/1973

OLD/1975/0885 - Notice of Proposed Demolition of listed building (Circular 80/71 Consultation).- 27/08/1975

OLD/1982/0903 - Display of temporary screen comprising 1x12 panel (36'x10') advertising display unit. – Refused 20/01/1982

OLD/1983/0955 - Demolition of Listed Building – Refused 28/02/1983

OLD/1956/0426 - Proposed site for petrol filling station – Refused 04/10/1956

OLD/1955/0450 - A proposed petrol filling station on Archway Road frontage - Refused 05/09/1955

HGY/2010/1652 - Demolition of 1940s extensions to listed villa and replacement with new single storey extension; repairs to fabric and replanning of interior; extension of terrace to Archway Road; 2 new flats set back from Cholmeley Park frontage; new bicycle store and recycling area; removal of trees and planting of new trees; new hard landscaping and planting – Withdrawn 05/04/2011

HGY/2010/1653 - Listed Building Consent for demolition of 1940s extensions to listed villa and replacement with new single storey extension; repairs to fabric and replanning of interior; extension of terrace to Archway Road; 2 new flats set back from Cholmeley Park frontage; new bicycle storey and recycling area; removal of trees and planting of new trees; new hard landscaping and planting – Withdrawn 05/04/2011

HGY/2011/0193 - Demolition of 1940s extensions to listed villa and replacement with new single storey extension; repairs to fabric and re-planning of interior; extension of terrace to Archway Road to accommodate 4 self contained flats; erection of a detached 4 bedroom residential unit to front onto Cholmeley Park with an associated off-street car parking space; removal of specified trees and planting of new trees and hard and soft landscaping to the site - Recommended for Approval by Officers Refused by Planning Committee 21/04/2011

HGY/2011/0194 - Listed Building Consent for demolition of 1940s extensions to listed villa and replacement with new single storey extension; repairs to fabric and re-planning of interior; extension of terrace to Archway Road to accommodate 4 self contained flats; erection of a detached 4 bedroom residential unit to front onto Cholmeley Park with an associated off-street car parking space; removal of specified trees and planting of new trees and hard and soft landscaping to the site – Recommended for Approval by Officers Refused by Planning Committee 21/04/2011

#### **4. RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY**

##### **4.1 National Planning Policy**

Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development  
Planning Policy Statement 3: Housing  
Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment

4.2 London Plan- 2008 (Incorporating Alterations)

Policy 3A.1 Increasing London's supply of housing  
Policy 3A.2 Borough housing targets  
Policy 3A.3 Maximising the potential of sites (London Plan Density Matrix)  
Policy 4B.5 Creating an inclusive environment  
Policy 4B.8 Respect local context and communities  
Policy 4B.12 Heritage conservation

4.3 Unitary Development Plan

G1 Environment  
G2 Development and Urban Design  
G3 Housing Supply  
UD2 Sustainable Design & Construction  
UD3 General Principles  
UD4 Quality Design  
UD7 Waste Storage  
ENV6 Noise Pollution  
ENV7 Air, Water and Light Pollution  
HSG1 New Housing Development  
HSG9 Density Standards  
M10 Parking for Development  
OS17 Tree Protection, Tree Masses and Spines  
CSV1 Development in Conservation Areas  
CSV2 Listed Buildings  
CSV4 Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings  
CSV5 Alterations and Extensions in Conservation Areas  
CSV7 Demolition in Conservation Area  
CSv8 Archaeology

4.4 Supplementary Planning Guidance / Documents

SPG1a Design Guidance  
SPG2 Conservation and Archaeology  
'Housing' SPD October 2008  
SPG3c Backlands Development  
SPG8b Materials  
SPG8e Light Pollution  
SPG9a Sustainability Statement

**5. CONSULTATION**

Statutory	Internal	External
English Heritage	Transportation Group Cleaving Building Control Conservation Team Ward Councillors Arboricultural Officer	<u>Amenity Groups</u> Highgate Society Highgate CAAC  <u>Local Residents</u> 1-7 Cholmeley Close, 1 – 15 Southwood Avenue, including flats, Archway Road - 217a b & c, 221 GF, FF, SF, TF & UGF flats, 221a Upper flat, Flats 1-4 223, 225 – Flats 1-4 & Flats 1a, 227 – GF & FF flat, 229 – GF & FF, 231, 233 – Ground floor flat, 235. 237, 248, 248a, 248b, 248c, 250, 250a, 250b, 250c, 250d, 252, 252a, 252b, 252c, 254, 254a, 254b, 254c, 254d, 256, 256a, 256b, 256c, 258 – FF, FF rear, GF middle, GF front, GF rear, Second/ Third Floor, 260, 260a, 260b, 262, 264, 268, 270, 272, 274, 278, 278a, 278b, 278c, 280, 280a, 280b, 280c, 282, 282a, 282b, 282c, 284, 282a, 282b, 282c, 284 a-c, 286 a-c, 288a-c, 290 a-c, 292, 294 a-c, 296 a-c,  9-15 Highgate Avenue, 1-12 Cholmeley Park (including 1a, 7a, 12a)

## 5. RESPONSES

### English Heritage

- 5.1 English Heritage commented on the previous proposals for the site. In terms of the current application they state that “this application should be determined in accordance with national and local planning policy on the basis of specialist conservation advice”.

### Highgate CAAC

- 5.2 “Welcome the refurbishment of the listed villa and do not object to the extension of the terrace along the Archway Road, however are concerned

about the number of mature trees to be removed and feel this should be reconsidered. They also deplore the reference to a further application re the building of a new house in the rear garden. This kind of 'salami slicing' of planning applications is of benefit only to the developer relying on 'objection fatigue' on the part of neighbours CAACs etc; it increases costs to the LA and makes an overall assessment of the impact of scheme very difficult. The planning department should make it clear to the developers that such an approach will be to the prejudice of any applications made in this manner.”

#### Highgate Society

- 5.3 Note the removal from this new application of the proposed new house which was to be sited to the rear of the listed building. This was inappropriate and had an adverse effect on the amenity of the neighbours. However, the applicants have announced their intention of submitting a further application for this house. The Society believe that this renders the current application premature, as it cannot be considered in the context of what else is proposed. If the further application is similar to the previous one, this has already been rejected as inappropriate and damaging to neighbours' amenities. Highgate Society would, in any case, regard this as over development of the site.
- 5.4 The two buildings onto Archway Road are generally acceptable but Highgate Society have major concerns about the basements in these. The land slopes steeply to the rear, effectively rendering the basement rooms to the rear as being 2 storeys below ground level. We do not think this will give satisfactory amenity to these flats in terms of lighting or outlook.
- 5.5 The front basements face Archway Road which is a major arterial route carrying heavy traffic. The Society has had a consistent policy of objecting to basements onto Archway Road and this has, in the past, been upheld by Haringey. They are concerned that the noise, vibration and air pollution from the road will render these units virtually uninhabitable, particularly the bedrooms.
- 5.6 Highgate Society are also concerned that the basement, with the 2 storey excavation to the rear will affect the ground conditions and water flow in the area. We are aware that there are ancient water courses in this area and feel that any excavation and basement construction should be supported by a full hydrological report. On these grounds, the Society objects to the application

#### London Fire & Emergency Planning Authority

- 5.7 The Brigade is not satisfied with the proposal as there is insufficient information to show compliance with part B5 of Building Regulations.

#### Arboricultural Officer

- 5.8 The Arboricultural Impact Assessment / Implication Assessment and Tree Protection Plan have been drafted in accordance with BS 5837: 2005. They

provide an adequate level of information to show all the trees have been considered in the planning process and the proposed protective measures should ensure there are no detrimental effects on the trees to be retained. However, robust planning conditions must be attached to any planning approval to enforce this.

- 5.9 All tree protection measures and associated works must be installed / undertaken as stated in the Method Statement (sequence of works). A pre-commencement site meeting must be specified and attended by all interested parties (Site manager, Consultant Arboriculturist, Council Arboriculturist and Architect) to confirm all the protection measures to be installed for trees.
- 5.10 The trees identified for removal are either in a poor condition or of low quality and amenity value. The new landscaping proposal aims to plant over 30 new trees to replace those to be removed and increase screening of the site. The proposed species and planting locations would appear suitable taking into consideration the existing trees and existing/proposed structures. The planting of native trees will enhance the woodland effect and increase biodiversity. Some of the species (Hornbeam, Wild cherry and Silver birch) have the capacity to grow into moderately sized trees.

#### Local Residents

- 5.8 Letter/ emails have been received from the residents of the following properties 41 Granville Road, Wood Green, Garden flat No 3, No's 4, 8, 10 Cholmeley Park, The Barn, Bisham Grange, Marlow Bucks, 13 Southwood Avenue, expressing the following comments/ concerns as summarised below:
- Loss of trees - simply not good enough to replace them with saplings that will take years to mature;
  - Extensions should be not larger than the existing;
  - Buildings should not be erected in back gardens and particularly the back gardens of listed buildings;
  - Concern about piecemeal approach to development on site;
  - No development can take place in the setting of a listed building unless such development is to finance the improvements to the villa;
  - Parts of the site are subject to periodic flooding;
  - No reference has been made on the plans for the water courses expressed by local residents;
  - Presence of bin store and bike store will add little enhancement to the Cholmeley Park perimeter of the historic villa – design and place should be reconsidered;
  - Basement excavation for Victorian style houses on Archway Road will involve considerable excavation, down two stories. Most properties on Archway Road have shallow foundation built on London clay.
  - Planning permission should only be granted if it can be clearly demonstrated that such basement excavation will not have a detrimental impact on neighbouring properties;
  - Underground watercourse that runs through the site may affect basement;

## 6. ANALYSIS / ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICATION

### Background

6.1 This current application leads on from a previous application and accompanying listed building application for development on this site consisting of 3 elements, namely:

- Alterations/ refurbishment of the listed building with improved landscaping including enhanced screening from the Archway Road;
- The erection of a new two-storey house with lower ground floor to the side and set back slightly from the No 2 Cholmeley Park;
- The erection of a new building to the side of 227 Archway Road to be read as an extension to the terrace to accommodate 4 self contained flats.

6.2 This application had been recommended for approval by Officers but was refused planning permission by the Planning Committee in April 2011 on the grounds that:

“The proposed development to the rear of the site, by reason of its siting, design and footprint would represent a cramped form of development which would have an unsympathetic relationship with the Listed Building on site and with adjoining properties, adversely affecting their residential and visual amenities. Furthermore the introduction of such a development on this part of the site would not preserve or enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. As such the proposed development is considered to be contrary to Policies UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas' and CSV2 'Listed Building' of the adopted Haringey Unitary Development Plan 2006 and supplementary planning guidance SPG1a 'Design Guidance', SPG2 'Conservation and Archaeology' and the Council's 'Housing' Supplementary Planning Document 2008”

6.3 The current application is very similar to these previous applications in that it is for two of the three elements, namely:

- Alterations/ refurbishment of the listed building with improved landscaping including enhanced screening from the Archway Road;
- The erection of a new building to the side of 227 Archway Road to be read as an extension to the terrace to accommodate 4 self contained flats.

6.4 The main issues in the determination of this application are considered to be (1) Principle of development; (2) Design, form & layout; (3) Impact on the setting of the Listed Building; (4) Impact on the character and appearance of the



Conservation Area; (5) Landscaping/ Impact on trees; (6) Impact on residential amenity and (7) Access and parking.

#### Principle of development

- 6.5 The application site is a large site with frontages onto Cholmeley Park and Archway Road and is located in an established residential road with a variety of housing types. As such a scheme for residential development is compatible with the established character of uses in the area. The site contains a Grade II listed villa built between 1886 & 1888. The outside of the building and the grounds are not in good condition. As per the comments previously from English Heritage they have no in principle objection to the introduction of some additional development on this site. As outlined further on in this report it is considered that the extension to the Archway Road terrace would not detract significantly from the setting of the listed building.
- 6.6 Bearing these two points in mind and bearing in mind the proposal would meet the criteria set out in policy HSG1 'New Housing Development', there is no in principle objection to the creation of additional residential accommodation on this site. The density of the proposed development would fall below the density range of 200-700 habitable rooms per hectare as advocated in policy HSG9. The number of habitable rooms is presently 16 (all in the villa) and will increase to 27 habitable rooms (14 of them in the villa) giving a density of 150 habitable room per hectare.
- 6.7 The Council has specific policy considerations in regards to backland development as outlined in SPG3c. However bearing in mind this site has active frontages onto Cholmeley Park and Archway Road; the site cannot be viewed specifically as a backland site. The site in question is not a protected open space for nature conservation/ ecological value.

#### Design, Form & Layout

- 6.8 The original listed building has been unsympathetically altered in intervening years, and it has poor quality side and rear extensions which detract from the special historic and architectural interest of the original building. The front elevation of the building retains its original appearance with a fine late 19<sup>th</sup> century front elevation on of Gault brick with bracketed eaves, slate roof and portico. The proposal for retaining the original building and replacing the existing 1940s side and rear extensions is considered acceptable, subject to the appropriate repair of the original building and use of appropriate materials to match the existing building. The front garden of the listed building will be remodelled / landscaped and the entrance to this building will be via the original front door with steps down to Archway Road and then down to a new entrance from Cholmeley Park.
- 6.9 The new building fronting onto Archway Road will be two storeys plus basement with accommodation within the roofspace. The existing terrace of four houses (227-233) on Archway Road will be extended by the addition of a

double fronted building with a single entrance door. This does not completely replicate the proportions of the original terrace which is characterised by individual terrace properties with established 6m span between cross walls with individual front doors sitting in groups of two as a mirror image of each other. In order to prevent the extensions to the terrace extending in front of the listed building a smaller width double fronted building with central doorway has been chosen. The extension will be of a similar period style to the original terrace using similar brick with white painted rendered detailing, traditional timber windows and a slate roof with a half hipped roof on the gable end. The flatted units within this building will meet the floorspace minima as set out in the Council's Housing SPD.

Listed Villa	Unit Size	Floorspace	Archway Road	Unit Size	Floorspace
FLAT 1	2 Bed	82.75 m <sup>2</sup>	FLAT 1	2 Bed	90.71 m <sup>2</sup>
FLAT 2	1 Bed	52.25 m <sup>2</sup>	FLAT 2	2 Bed	91.74 m <sup>2</sup>
FLAT 3	1 Bed	56.97 m <sup>2</sup>	FLAT 3	2 Bed	97.19 m <sup>2</sup>
FLAT 4	2 Bed	73.71 m <sup>2</sup>	FLAT 4	1 Bed	52.12 m <sup>2</sup>
FLAT 5	2 Bed	68.60 m <sup>2</sup>			

- 6.10 The proposed Archway Road development will include the creation of basement floor under part of the building (the main two storey element). The size of the basement is not large and given the basement floor will sit below the footprint of the proposed houses, it is considered that the foundations taken deeper will not affect drainage / soak away within the rear garden.
- 6.11 A number of residents have raised concern regarding the basement excavation and impact on foundations and the water course. Regarding the issue of construction works affecting neighbouring properties this is a civil matter between the two parties and is outside the remit of planning, however in this case the adjoining end of terrace property belongs to the applicant. Regarding the issue of the water table, as per studies carried out by other London LAs it is accepted that sub-surface conditions are unusually adversely affecting by basement development as flowing groundwater will usually simply find an alternative route when it meets an underground obstruction, and static groundwater will re-distribute itself. It is therefore likely that, in general, the effect of a new basement on groundwater levels will be relatively small, and may be less significant than natural seasonal or other variations in the groundwater table.
- 6.12 It is noted that concern has been raised about the principle of a basement floor and the quality of accommodation it would provide. In this case the basement floor will provide bedroom accommodation for two of the flats. These flats will have living and dining room accommodation at ground floor level. The proposal will involve excavating a small strip immediately in front of the projecting bay windows and the construction of retaining walls to form light wells. These lightwells are not deep and will not require a vertical rail around them. The tops of these windows will also be positioned above the height of

the retaining wall to the lightwell, as the ground floor of the building will sit above street level. These front bedrooms will receive adequate light and ventilation. Such an arrangement of having the ground floor level elevated above street level and the use of high level windows/ lightwells to the basement floor is common to properties of this style. The windows to the bedrooms at the back of this basement floor will have full height openable doors.

- 6.13 The recycling/ refuse storage area for the flats within the listed villa will be kept in a dedicated storage area dug in the bank along Cholmeley Park and screened from view. For the Archway Road flats wheely bin will be stored in side the front boundary wall in a dedicated space. While a resident has expresses concerns about the siting of the bins and bicycle store on Cholmeley Park, as noted these will be kept low and screened from view.
- 6.14 Overall the building form, detailing and associated materials with the replacement extensions to the villa and the extension to the terrace have been carefully considered to respect the setting of the listed building and the distinctiveness and character of the area. As such the proposal is considered to be in accordance with policies UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design'. CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and SPG1a 'Design Guidance' and SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology'.

#### Impact on the setting of Listed Building

- 6.15 No 225 Archway is a detached two- storey, Grade II listed, mid C19 villa located on a large corner plot at the junction of Archway Road and Cholmeley Park. Its frontage features an Ionic portico, is 3 windows wide, and has a slightly projecting two storey two window wide right wing. It is constructed in pale grey brickwork with brickwork quoins. It has gauged yellow brick arches with keystones to recessed sash windows with margin lights. It has a low pitched slated roof with long moulded brackets to the eaves soffit. The building sits back from the road and is set on a raised level on the site surrounded by trees.
- 6.16 As a Grade II listed building it enjoys statutory protection in accordance with the Planning (LBCA) Act 1990. The Council's UDP policies CSV2, CSV4 and CSV6 protect it and its setting from demolition or from any development which would adversely affect its special architectural and historic interest. Also as the building stands within Highgate Conservation Area, it is protected by UDP policy CSV1, and any development should preserve the character and appearance of the conservation area
- 6.17 As set out in PPS5 Grade II listed buildings are of special interest and warrant every effort being made to preserve them. PPS5 emphasises that the historic environment is made up of irreplaceable assets that make a real contribution to our quality of life and quality of places and that it is important that they are understood, conserved and, where appropriate, enhanced as markers of our

past. This statement also states that the historic environment, alongside the best in new design, is an essential element in creating distinctive, enjoyable and successful places in which to live and work. This policy statement also recognises the important role of heritage assets in economic growth, attracting investment and providing a focus for successful regeneration. Section HE11 of PPS5 recognises the importance of 'enabling development' as a means of securing the long term future of a heritage asset.

- 6.18 As in many cases the setting of a listed building is very often an essential part of the building's character and therefore the garden/ curtilage is important in protecting the historic character and development of this historic buildings. The front garden and the large set back from the street is particularly important in defining the setting of the building
- 6.19 The requirements of policies CSV2 and CSV4 apply in this case, as well as the guidance contained in SPG2. Policy CSV4 states that it is required that alterations and extensions to listed buildings to:
- be necessary and not detrimental to the architectural and historical integrity and detailing of a listed building's interior and exterior;
  - relate sensitively to the original building; and not adversely affect the setting of a listed building.
- 6.20 The building is asymmetric in arrangement yet well proportioned and constructed of materials of a reasonably good quality, presenting its main face towards the Archway Road. The building is however largely concealed from view from Archway Road by a line of high conifers trees. As outlined above the listed building has been unsympathetically altered in intervening years, and it has a poor quality side and rear extensions of an ad-hoc nature which detract from the special historic and architectural interest of the original building. The extensions proposed are considered acceptable as they are designed as one piece and subject to the use of appropriate materials to match the existing in composition therefore tying in more successfully with original building.
- 6.21 Inside the property there is very little of any real significance. Many of original details i.e. cornices or joinery appropriate to the original arrangement/ design of the house have been lost. Internally there will be some rationalisation and reordering of the accommodation (i.e. to introduce en-suite bathrooms). Internally the works will be sympathetic to the arrangement of the principal rooms of the original dwelling.
- 6.22 The proposed landscaping to the site will open up the front elevation and enhance the curtilage to the site. A new pedestrian entrance pathway will be created which will re-connect the villa with Archway Road. This new terraces and stepped stone pathway will connect with the portico along front elevation.
- 6.23 The siting and alignment of the proposed extension to the Archway terrace is considered acceptable as it will not adversely encroach with the space which defines and delineates the listed building as a large freestanding house,

standing on a large corner site within a garden setting. This aspect of the development will enable and secure the repair and restoration of the listed building. As part of a S106 agreement works to the site will be required to be phased in order to deliver improvements to the listed building first before the second phase, the extension to the Archway Road terrace, is implemented

- 6.24 The features of greatest significance to the building will be retained and enhanced; achieved particularly through the landscaping proposals to the front and rear of the site, which will enhance the building setting and give a tidier appearance onto Archway Road.

#### Impact on the character and appearance of the Conservation Area

- 6.25 The character of application site and the immediate surrounding is made up of a number of different elements. The site importantly maintains a 'gap' between the terraced houses on Archway Road and the semi-detached houses on Cholmeley Park and contains a number of mature trees which add to the open nature of the site. At present the line of high conifers trees to the front of the listed building spoilt the appearance and setting of this building.
- 6.26 Archway Road itself is a very busy arterial road consisting of variety of buildings, mainly late Victorian buildings. No's 227- 233 Archway Road is a terrace of 4 houses of uniformity and proportion with its half hipped roof at each end. Years of uncertainty over the future of Archway Road, as well as the large volume of heavy traffic that passes through on the way to central London have resulted in a neglected appearance. There is also a profusion of street furniture such as speed cameras, bollards and railings, lampposts, road signs and shop signs, most of which is not sensitively designed. The narrowness of the pavements, particularly along certain stretches of the road, makes pedestrians feel vulnerable to the high-speed traffic.
- 6.27 Cholmely Park is a long tree lined street with large semi-detached or detached properties of the late Victorian and early Edwardian eras, which display a variety of architectural styles. The properties along the road have large front gardens which are carefully tended and well planted. The sloping nature of the streets gives views of mature trees both in nearby gardens and in the distance. The extensive greenery together with the changing gradient and winding pathways or steps leading from the front doors to the garden gates contribute significantly to the quality of the street.
- 6.28 The interventions now proposed to restore the integrity of listed building and the extension of the Archway Road terrace are considered to be more sensitive to the setting of the building and the character of the site. The landscaping proposal to the front and rear of the site will enhance the building setting and give a tidier appearance onto Archway Road. The proposed extension to the Archway Road terrace in terms of its position, form, design and appearance, will have a satisfactory relationship with the listed building.

- 6.29 Overall the proposed development will respect the character and appearance of this part of the conservation area and therefore the proposed development is considered to be in accordance with the requirement of policy UD4 'Quality Design' and CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas'.

#### Trees & Landscaping

- 6.30 As part of the application a detailed arboricultural report has been submitted. The front garden contains a large number of grade C trees which have been allowed to grow to a point where they are causing subsidence to the listed building. There are no protected trees within this site
- 6.31 The site has an attractive 'woodland' feel principally because of the presence of a number of large mature trees, many self seeded; large ash and large sycamore along the perimeters of the site. This is important to the amenity of adjoining residents on Southwood & Highgate Avenue's and 2 & 4 Cholmeley Park as well as to the character and appearance of this part of the conservation area. There is one oak (red oak) located to the back of the site which is an important feature tree.
- 6.32 As outlined above the site will be extensively re-landscaped, in particular to enhance the front of the villa and its relationship with Archway Road and to compensate for the loss of some mature trees to the back of the site. The existing mature trees will be supplemented by new planting to enhance the green screen between the Archway Road and the villa. Planting of a more appropriate scale - holly, hazel and crab apple are smaller trees associated with woodland edge will be used closer to the buildings. In addition perimeter native hedgerow planting (Silver Birch, Hazel and Hornbeam) will be used along the rear perimeter to the rear of the site and along the boundary with the properties on Southwood Avenue evergreen planting will be incorporated along the boundary. Closer to the buildings some non native species will be planted for reason of ornament and scale. In between the new the listed villa and the rear garden area will be a line of Cherry trees.

#### Impact on Residential Amenity

- 6.33 In comparison to the previously submitted scheme the building to the back of the site has been removed from the proposal therefore meaning that the properties which adjoin the rear garden area of the villa will not be adversely affected.
- 6.34 The sting of extension to the terrace and its associated fenestration will lead to some additional overlooking in the direction of the gardens of No 1 & 3 Southwood Avenue and some impact on their outlook. However, bearing in mind the difference in levels in between these sites and the distance between the back of the building and the shared boundary this impact will not be significant. The positioning of terraces in this way is not an unusual relationship between properties in a suburban environment of this nature. The

incorporating of additional landscaping along the rear boundary of the site would help mitigate this impact.

- 6.35 Overall the proposed development has taken careful consideration in terms of its layout and design to ensure that the privacy and amenity of neighbouring occupiers are not be adversely affected. As such the proposal is considered to be in accordance with policy UD3 and with sections 8.20-8.27 of the Housing SPD.

#### Access and Parking

- 6.36 The application site falls within a PTAL 4 area and is within walking distance of Highgate Tube Station and a number of different bus services. Secure cycle spaces will be proved on site.
- 6.37 In respect of the demand for on street car parking associated with this proposal and the impact this will have on the amenities of neighbouring occupiers, Officers are mindful of comments in a 2003 and 2007 appeal decisions for a nearby site at 235- 237 Archway Road. In the 2003 appeal decision a Inspector stated that there is ‘no call for parking on this site as the site is two minutes walk from a tube station and faces a busy road carrying myriad of buses’. In addition the Inspector considered the creation of two parking spaces would seriously detract from the amenity value of the area. In a 2005 application for this site there was no off street car parking provided with the scheme of flats for this site and the Inspector did not considered this proposal to be contrary to policy M10.
- 6.38 Officers would point out that the existing flats within the villa do not benefit from offstreet car parking. While the application site falls within the Archway Road Restricted Conversion Area, this cannot be applied in respect of new buildings as Planning Inspectors have previously dismissed the conversion policy when dealing with new buildings.
- 6.39 Taking into account the PTAL rating for this site, and the proximity of the site to public transport it is considered that the new flatted units are suitable for a ‘car-free’ development. This will be secured by way of a Section 106 agreement and will prevent future occupiers from applying for residents parking permits under the terms of the relevant traffic management order. In addition Officers would also require the S106 to include the provision of one year’s free membership to a “Car club scheme” for residents of the new development to help mitigate the lack of off-street parking provision.

## **7. CONCLUSION**

- 7.1 The current application follows on from a previously refused scheme, which is very similar to the current application, but differs in that it removes the proposal for a two-storey house with lower ground floor, which would have fronted onto Cholmeley Park. The proposal will involve alterations, minor extensions and refurbishment of the existing Grade II, which currently contains

5 self contained flats and the erection of a new building to the side of 227 Archway Road to be read as an extension to the terrace to accommodate 4 self contained flats (1 x 1 bed unit and 3 x 2 bed).

- 7.2 The proposed extension to the Archway Road terrace in terms of its position, form, design and appearance, will have a satisfactory relationship with the listed building and will not adversely affect the residential and visual amenities of adjoining occupiers. The four new residential units to front onto Archway Road will be secured to be 'car free' (by way of a S106 agreement) and as such the proposal will not adversely affect parking conditions in the immediate surroundings.
- 7.3 The proposed development is considered to be in accordance with strategic planning guidance and policies as set out in the Adopted Haringey Unitary Development Plan (July 2006); in particular the following Policies UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', G3 'Housing Supply', G10 'Conservation', HSG1 'New Housing Development', HSG9 'Density Standards', HSG10 'Dwelling Mix', CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV2 'Listed Buildings', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and OS17 Tree Protection, Tree Masses and Spines and Supplementary Planning Guidance SPG1a 'Design Guidance and Design Statements', SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology' and SPD Housing 2008. This application is therefore recommend for approval subject to conditions and the applicant entering into a S106 agreement

## 8. RECOMMENDATION

### RECOMMENDATION 1

- 9.1 The Sub-Committee is recommended to RESOLVE as follows: (1) That planning permission be granted in accordance with planning application no, HGY/2011/0998 subject to a pre-condition that the owners of the application site shall first have entered into an Agreement or Agreements with the Council under Section 106 of the Town & Country Planning Act 1990 (As Amended) and Section 16 of the Greater London Council (General Powers) Act 1974 in order to secure:
- (1.1) A sum of £1,000.00 towards the amendment of the relevant Traffic Management Order(s) (TMO) controlling on-street parking in the vicinity of the site to reflect that the 4 new residential units to front onto Archway Road shall be designated 'car free' and therefore no residents therein will be entitled to apply for a residents parking permit under the terms of this Traffic Management Order(s) (TMO);
- (1.2) The applicant agrees to phase the proposed development to deliver the improvements to the Listed Building first before the second phase of the scheme is implemented;



(1.3) The S106 to include the provision of one years free membership to a “Car club scheme” for residents of the new development to help mitigate the lack of off-street parking provision;

(1.3) The developer to pay a administration / monitoring cost of £500.00 in connection with this Section 106 agreement.

#### RECOMMENDATION 2

9.2 That in the absence of the Agreement referred to in the resolution above being completed by 30<sup>th</sup> September 2011, planning application reference number HGY/2011/0998 be refused for the following reason:

In the absence of a formal undertaking to secure a Section 106 Agreement for the additional flatted units associated with this proposal to be ‘car free’ the proposal is considered contrary to policy M10 ‘Parking for Development’ of the adopted Haringey Unitary Development (2006).

#### RECOMMENDATION 3

9.3 In the event that the Planning Application is refused for the reason set out above, the Assistant Director (PEPP) (in consultation with the Chair of Planning Committee) is hereby authorised to approve any further application for planning permission which duplicates the Planning Application provided that:

- (i) there has not been any material change in circumstances in the relevant planning considerations, and
- (ii) the further application for planning permission is submitted to and approved by the Assistant Director (PEPP) within a period of not more than 12 months from the date of the said refusal, and
- (iii) the relevant parties shall have previously entered into the agreement contemplated in resolution (1) above to secure the obligations specified therein.

#### RECOMMENDATION 4

9.4 That following completion of the Agreement referred to in (1) above, planning permission be GRANTED in accordance with planning application no HGY/2011/0998 and the Applicant’s drawing No.(s) S12 PLA PP3 100, 101, 102, 103, 105, 501, 502, 505, 520, 550 & 560 subject to the following conditions:

#### IMPLEMENTATION

1. The development hereby authorised must be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission, failing which the permission shall be of no effect. Reason: This condition is imposed by virtue of

the provisions of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and to prevent the accumulation of unimplemented planning permissions.

2. The development hereby authorised shall be carried out in complete accordance with the plans and specifications submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details and in the interests of amenity.

3. All hard and soft landscape works shall be carried out in accordance with the approved details and to a reasonable standard in accordance with the relevant recommendations of appropriate British Standards or other recognised Codes of Good Practice. The works shall be carried out prior to the occupation of any part of the development or in accordance with the timetable agreed with the Local Planning Authority. Any trees or plants that, within a period of five years after planting, are removed, die or become, in the opinion of the Local Planning Authority, seriously damaged or defective, shall be replaced as soon as is reasonably practicable with others of species, size and number as originally approved, unless the Local Planning Authority gives its written consent to any variation.

Reason: To ensure the provision, establishment and maintenance of a reasonable standard of landscape and tree coverage on site in accordance with the approved designs.

4. All existing trees shall be retained, unless shown on the approved drawings as being removed and those identified in the Arboricultural Impact Assessment / Implication Assessment and Tree Protection Plan shall be protected from damage and safeguarded during the course of the site works and building operations. No work shall commence on site until a pre-commencement site meeting takes place between the Architect, the consulting Arboriculturist, the Local Authority's Arboricultural Officer and a Planning Officer to confirm tree protective measures to be implemented. Such fencing shall be maintained during the course of the works on site and no unauthorised access or placement of goods, fuels or chemicals, soils or other materials shall take place inside the fenced area.

Reason: To ensure that trees, shrubs and other natural features to be retained are adequately protected from damage to health and stability throughout the construction period in the interests of amenity.

#### MATERIALS & BOUNDARY TREATMENT

5. Notwithstanding the description of the materials in the application, no development shall be commenced until precise details of the external materials to be used in connection with the development hereby permitted have been submitted to, approved in writing by and implemented in accordance with the requirements of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to retain control over the external appearance of the development in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

6. All new external and internal works and finishes and works of making good the retained fabric of the Listed Building shall match the existing with regard to the methods used and to material, colour, texture and profile, unless shown otherwise on the drawings or other documentation hereby approved or required by any conditions attached to this consent.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building.

7. Notwithstanding any indication on the submitted drawings, details of the siting and design of all walls, gates, fencing, railings or other means of enclosure shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The walls/gates/fencing/railings/enclosures shall be erected in accordance with the approved details following completion and occupation of the building hereby approved.

Reason: In order to retain control over the external appearance of the development and in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

## CONSTRUCTION

8. The construction works of the development hereby granted shall not be carried out before 0800 or after 1800 hours Monday to Friday or before 0800 or after 1300 hours on Saturday and not at all on Sundays or Bank Holidays

Reason: In order to ensure that the proposal does not prejudice the enjoyment of neighbouring occupiers of their properties.

9. The contractor on site shall ensure that all due care is taken to protect the historic fabric of the Listed Building from damage during the course of the works, including any materials, or elements of structure, that may be temporarily taken down and put to one side, and afterwards re-erected as part of the repair and reinstatement works.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building

10. No development shall take place until details of a construction management plan construction logistics plan are submitted and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. The construction management plan shall include details of vehicle parking and manoeuvring areas, wheel washing facilities, location of storage area for building materials, protective, spoil removal. Thereafter, the approved construction plan shall be fully implemented and

adhered to during the construction phase of the development hereby approved.

Reason: In order to ensure that the proposal does not prejudice the enjoyment of neighbouring occupiers of their properties.

## REASONS FOR APPROVAL

The proposed alteration, minor extensions and a refurbishment of the existing Grade II Listed Building are considered acceptable and in addition the siting and design of the new building and associated landscaping are considered to be designed sensitively in terms of its relationship with the listed building, the open and tree line character of this site and the building patterns of the adjoining properties. The proposed development will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the conservation area. The proposal will achieve an acceptable relationship with adjoining properties and will not adversely affect the residential and visual amenities of adjoining occupiers or adversely affect parking conditions in the immediate surrounding.

The proposed development accords with strategic planning guidance and policies as set out in the Adopted Haringey Unitary Development Plan (July 2006); in particular the following Policies UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', G3 'Housing Supply', G10 'Conservation', HSG1 'New Housing Development', HSG9 'Density Standards', HSG10 'Dwelling Mix', CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV2 'Listed Buildings', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and OS17 Tree Protection, Tree Masses and Spines and Supplementary Planning Guidance SPG1a 'Design Guidance and Design Statements', SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology' and SPD Housing 2008.

NFORMATIVE: The new development will require numbering. The applicant should contact the Local Charges at least six weeks before the development is occupied (tel. 020 8489 5573) to arrange for the allocation of a suitable address.

NFORMATIVE: As per Condition 10 above TfL requests that a Construction Management Plan (CMP) and Construction Logistics Plan (CLP) be submitted and approved by both the local authority and TfL prior to work commence on site. It is requested that movements of construction vehicles shall be carefully planned and coordinated to avoid the AM and PM hours. It is requested that a construction vehicles should load/ unload/ park/ stop away from A1 Archway Road.

NFORMATIVE: As per Condition 7 above it is requested that the developer to provide details on the proposed wall adjacent to the A1 Archway Road footway and how the wall would be constructed; and also details on site protection measure to prevent damage caused to the TLRN public highway of A1 Archway Road for during the construction work inside the site. It must be noted that TfL may require Structural Approval for the wall if deemed necessary; this is ensure that the structural integrity of A1 Archway Road would not be compromised.

INFORMATIVE: The footway and carriageway on A1 Archway Road must not be blocked during the construction and maintenance of the proposal. Temporary obstruction during the construction must be kept to a minimum and should not encroach on the clear space needed to provide safe passage for pedestrians, or obstruct the flow of traffic on the A1 Archway Road.

No skip or construction materials shall be kept on the footway or carriageway of A1 Archway Road at all times. It must also be aware that TfL would rectify damage caused to the TLRN public highway from the construction of the development, and the developer would be expected to be responsible for the full cost of repair work.

It is also advised that the developer/ contractor would be required to submit a London Street Work Permit application to TfL for any occupation of the public highway associated with the construction work; this includes any form of temporary traffic management as well as the parking of construction vehicles outside its permitted hours.

It is requested that no gate/ door adjacent to A1 Archway Road shall be opened outward which would encroach on any part of public highway, this is to comply with Section 153 of Highways Act 1980.

INFORMATIVE: The Olympic Route Network (ORN) and Paralympic Route Network (PRN) will operate during the Olympic and Paralympic Games period between June and September 2012. During this period, there will be an impact on construction works, utility works and highway licensed activities (for example, skips and building materials) if they affect the roads designated as a part of the ORN/PRN and some of the surrounding streets. Other routes might also be affected and will also be required to be clear of any kinds of obstruction. These are not yet finalised, but will be advised as further information becomes available.



Proposed Site Layout



Terrace Extension / Front Elevation to Archway Road

## Street Elevations - Archway Road/ Cholmely Park





**Street Photos - Cholmeley Park**





Street Photos – Archway Road