

REPORT FOR CONSIDERATION AT PLANNING COMMITTEE

<p>Reference No: HGY/2009/1696</p>	<p>Ward: Bruce Grove</p>
<p>Address: 8 Bruce Grove N17 6RA</p> <p>Proposal: Listed Building consent for refurbishment of existing listed building to retain the existing pub use on ground and basement levels, and the redesign of the non-self contained residential units at upper levels to provide 3 self-contained residential units. Demolition of rear later addition to listed building and redevelopment of the rear of the site to provide 4 x 4 bed houses and 2 x 2 maisonettes units (AMENDED DESCRIPTION)</p> <p>Existing Use: Sui generis/C3 Proposed Use: Sui generis/C3</p> <p>Applicant: Mr Peter Cunningham Peachwalk Properties Ltd</p> <p>Ownership: Private</p>	
<p>Date received: 07/10/2009 Last amended date: 17/09/2010</p> <p>Drawing number of plans: 1176/P/01, 02 Rev D, 03 Rev C, 03-01 Rev C, 04 Rev C, 05 Rev C, 06 Rev B; 11220/sheet 2 & 3, 1176P/07, 08, 0910, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18.</p>	
<p>Case Officer Contact: Matthew Gunning</p>	
<p>PLANNING DESIGNATIONS: Listed Buildings, Road Network: B Road, Conservation Area</p>	
<p>RECOMMENDATION GRANT Listed Building Consent subject to conditions</p>	
<p>SUMMARY OF REPORT: The proposed development would involve a comprehensive redevelopment of this site involving alteration, minor extension and a refurbishment of the existing Grade II Listed Building. The existing trader’s club use on the ground floor and basement floor will be retained; while the upper floors would be divided into 3 self contained residential units. The main alteration now proposed to the Listed Building will be the insertion of an opening in the façade of the 1924 side extension to provide pedestrian access to the rear of the site. This opening is smaller and lower than that previously proposed and visually relates better to the scale and character of the building. The opening will be symmetrical in position with windows on either side. The alterations now proposed are considered to be sensitive will not disrupt the symmetry and proportions of building’s facade.</p>	

The development at the rear of the site is considered necessary to enable and to secure the proper repair, restoration and long term future of the Listed Building. The siting, design, form, detailing of the terrace block and associated landscaping to the rear of the site are considered acceptable and have been designed sensitively in terms of its relationship with the Listed Building. Overall the proposed development will restore and enhance the appearance of the Listed Building and will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. As such the proposal accords with policies CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology' This application is therefore recommend for APPRIVAL.

1. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 1.1 The application site is located on the south-western side of Bruce Grove and consists of a 2/3 storey Georgian building fronting onto Bruce Grove with a large single storey (double height) rear extension, which occupies the full width of the site and which projects back approximately 27m. The application site is currently occupied by a building known as Tottenham Trader's Club.
- 1.2 The main building fronting Bruce Grove forms part of a pair of symmetrical Grade II Georgian buildings. Bruce Grove comprises Tottenham's greatest concentration of listed Georgian townhouses. Bruce Grove was developed along the line of one of the avenues of Bruce Castle Park following the sale of parts of the estate in 1789. The plot structures of the properties fronting Bruce Grove are typical of the 18th century and comprise generous forecourts fronting the avenue and extremely long and narrow rear gardens stretching back from the rear of the terraces. The historic pattern of plots and gardens (the 'urban grain') is still legible along Bruce Grove, despite the fact that some plots have been combined or shortened.
- 1.3 The building in question is a substantial three storey buildings with a later two-storey side addition built in yellow London stock brick. The main adjoining section has three windows at upper floor level with parapets, moulded stucco cornices and shallow hipped slate roofs. The main entrance has been blocked up; however, the entrance to the north-west block retains a patterned radial fanlight, which may have been moved from the original door to its present location.
- 1.4 This building along with the adjoining property, No 7, were originally very handsome houses but, unfortunately have suffered sustained and extensive alterations, extensions, and sub-divisions within. No. 7 has an English Heritage Blue Plaque on the forward projecting wing of its elevation inscribed 'Luke Howard 1772-1864'. The original boundary walls, gate piers and railings to the front of this property have been removed and the front garden area paved over for car parking. Notwithstanding these alterations the balanced proportions and diminishing fenestration rhythm to upper floors contribute to the historic and architectural distinction of the property.
- 1.5 The application site adjoins No 9 Bruce Grove along the north-western boundary. This site contains a three storey (plus basement) Georgian building (also listed/ Grade 2) with a later side addition proving an arched access to the rear of the site with two

floors above. To the rear of the original townhouse at No 9 is a modern two-storey office block with 16 car parking spaces beyond this. This property contains a number of different officer uses/ employers. Adjoining No 9 on the other side is another listed Georgian town house (No 10) with a contemporary youth centre building to the rear, abutting the side boundary of No 9

- 1.6 To the rear of the application site and to the back of No 7 is a large open grassed/ treed area measuring 0.4ha in size. This is known as "Bruce Grove Wood" and is a designated 'Ecological Valuable Site of Local Importance'. To the side of No 7 Bruce Grove is an access road, known as, Champa Close, which serves a relatively new development of terrace properties and flats.
- 1.7 This part of Bruce Grove is within the Tottenham High Road Historic Corridor Regeneration Area. The application site falls just outside of Tottenham High Road Town Centre (Secondary Retail Frontage).

2 PLANNING HISTORY

HGY/2008/1980 - Refurbishment of existing building to retain existing pub use on ground / basement levels, and conversion of upper levels into 5 self-contained residential units comprising 1 x three bed flat, 3 x two bed flats and 1 x studio apartment. Demolition of rear addition to listed building and erection of 3 storey apartment block comprising 5 x one bed and 7 x two bed apartments – Refused 31/12/2008

HGY/2008/1985 - Listed Building Consent for refurbishment of existing building to retain existing pub use on ground / basement levels, and conversion of upper levels into 5 self-contained residential units comprising 1 x three bed flat, 3 x two bed flats and 1 x studio apartment. Demolition of rear addition to listed building and erection of 3 storey apartment block comprising 5 x one bed and 7 x two bed apartments – Refused 31/12/2008

HGY/1989/0433 - Display of illuminated advertisement to listed building. – Withdrawn - 20-02-90

HGY/1989/0431 - Display of illuminated advertisement sign to listed building. (Listed Building Consent). – Withdrawn 26-02-90

OLD/1988/0157 - Display of 2x4 sheet poster panels illuminated forming an integral part of a bus shelter outside nos. 31-32 – Approved 18-11-88

OLD/1984/0150 - Change of use of part of 1st floor for use as a day-nursery for children. – Approved 18-12-84

OLD/1981/0158 - Listed building consent for blocking of windows + internal rearrangement of dance hall at rear. – Approved 21-09-81

OLD/1981/0156 - Change of use of first floor to a day nursery and a self-contained flat and conversion of second and third floors into two self-contained flats – Approved 26-10-81

OLD/1978/0109 - Erection of a single storey rear assembly hall (details pursuant to outline approval dated 22/3/77) – Approved 09-08-78

OLD/1966/0093 - Extension to provide toilet accommodation. – Approved 29-11-66

OLD/1950/0072 - Erection of new boundary wall. – Approved 29-08-50

3. DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

- 3.1 The proposal is for the refurbishment of the existing listed building, retaining the existing trader's club use on ground floor and basement floors and the redesign of the non-self contained residential units at upper levels to provide 3 self-contained residential units. Demolition of rear later addition to listed building and redevelopment of the rear of the site to provide 4 x 4 bed houses and 2 x 2 maisonettes units.
- 3.2 The original staircase is to be retained and the upper floors are to be re-configured into self-contained apartments. An additional floor in the form of a contemporary light weight glazed addition over the existing two-storey building (north-west block) has been removed from the scheme.
- 3.3 It is proposed to demolish the existing rear extensions and provide access to the rear of the site via an undercroft. A lean-to conservatory is also proposed for the rear. The rear later addition (c.1928) to the Listed Building is to be demolished and a new storey 'L shaped' terrace block, comprising 4 x 4 bed dwellings with private gardens create and 2 x 2 bed maisonettes, is to be provided.

4 RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

4.1 National Planning Policy

Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning for the Historic Environment

4.2 The London Plan - 2008

Policy 4B.11 London's built heritage

Policy 4B.12 Heritage conservation

Policy 4B.13 Historic conservation-led regeneration

4.3 Adopted Unitary Development Plan, 2006

Policy G10 Conservation

Policy CSV1 Development in Conservation Areas

Policy CSV2 Listed Buildings

Policy CSV4 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings

4.4 Supplementary Planning Guidance/ Documents

SPG2 Conservation & Archaeology

4. CONSULTATION

As per HGY/2009/1695

5. RESPONSES

As per HGY/2009/1695

6. ANALYSIS / ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICATION

- 6.1 As noted above the subject property is a Grade II listed building and as such there is a legal requirement for its protection. The primary legislation relating to the conservation of Historic Environment is The Planning (Listed Buildings and Conservation Areas) Act 1990, as amended by the Planning and Compensation Act 1991 and the Planning and Compulsory Purchase Act 2004.
- 5.2 The 1990 (LBCA) Act requires local planning authorities to “have special regard to the desirability of preserving a listed building or its setting or any features of special architectural or historic interest” (Sections 16 (2) and 66(1)), and to pay “special attention to the desirability of preserving or enhancing the character and appearance of conservation areas” (Section 72). The requirements for the protection of the Historic Environment remain expanded upon within PPS5.
- 6.3 PPS5 emphasises that the historic environment is made up of irreplaceable assets that make a real contribution to our quality of life and our quality of places and that it is important that they are understood, conserved and, where appropriate, enhanced as markers of our past. This statement also states that the historic environment, alongside the best in new design, is an essential element in creating distinctive, enjoyable and successful places in which to live and work. This policy statement also recognises the important role of heritage assets in economic growth, attracting investment and providing a focus for successful regeneration. Section HE11 of PPS5 recognises the importance of ‘enabling development’ as a means of securing the long term future of a heritage asset when conservation through development compliance with policy cannot do so.
- 6.4 The requirements of policies CSV2 and CSV4 apply in this case, as well as the guidance contained in SPG2. Policy CSV4 states that it is required that alterations and extensions to listed buildings to:
- be necessary and not detrimental to the architectural and historical integrity and detailing of a listed building’s interior and exterior;
 - relate sensitively to the original building; and
 - not adversely affect the setting of a listed building.
- 6.5 The proposal is to create an opening in the façade of the later two-storey addition which sits in between the original three storey town house and No 9. This is for the purpose of creating pedestrian access to the new residential units to be erected to the rear of the site. The siting, design, form, detailing of the terrace block and associated landscaping are discussed in detail in Committee Report for application reference HGY/2009/1695.
- 6.6 In the previously refused application HGY/2008/1985, the opening through the frontage was larger and asymmetric. The dimensions and design of this previous arch was very similar to the arch of the adjoining property (No 9). The arch placed an undesirable emphasis on vehicular access. In particular the siting of the new arch close to the existing front entrance door, which has a pediment and a patterned radial

fanlight above and would have disrupted the symmetry and proportions of this façade.

- 6.7 The proposed opening in the current application is not intended to be a 'coach entrance' for traffic to drive through, but rather for pedestrian access only. The main entrance door and its decorative fanlight and surrounding framework will be reinstated back to its original position on the front elevation which is presently blocked up. In addition the basement windows and front lightwell will be reinstated.
- 6.8 The opening to gain access to the rear of the site is now much smaller, lower, and visually relates better to the scale and character of the 1924 side extension. The opening is located in a symmetrical position in the elevation of the side extension with a window on either side. It will have a gated entrance in the structural opening, providing normal access for pedestrian and cycles, and will exclude all vehicular traffic.
- 6.9 Along the rear elevation the listed building is to be refurbished with the rear elevation restored to its original fenestration pattern with a simple lean to glass conservatory added. The proposal is also for the insertion of one dormer windows on the rear elevation of the main roof form.
- 6.10 The development at the rear of the site is considered necessary to enable and to secure the proper repair, restoration and long term future of the Listed Building. The siting, design, form, detailing of the terrace block and associated landscaping to the rear of the site are considered acceptable and have been designed sensitively in terms of its relationship with the Listed Building. Overall the proposed development will restore and enhance the appearance of the Listed Building and will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. As such the proposal accords with polices CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology'

8. RECOMMENDATION

GRANT LISTED BUILDING CONSENT subject to conditions

Applicant's drawing No.(s) 1176/P/01, 02 Rev D, 03 Rev C, 03-01 Rev C, 04 Rev C, 05 Rev C, 06 Rev B; 11220/sheet 2 & 3, 1176P/07, 08, 0910, 11, 12, 13, 14, 15, 16, 17, 18.

Subject to the following conditions

IMPLEMENTATION

1. The development hereby authorised must be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission, failing which the permission shall be of no effect.

Reason: This condition is imposed by virtue of the provisions of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and to prevent the accumulation of unimplemented planning permissions.

2. The development hereby authorised shall be carried out in complete accordance with the plans and specifications submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority

Reason: In order to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details and in the interests of amenity.

EXTERNAL APPEARANCE

3. Notwithstanding the description of the materials in the application, no development shall be commenced until precise details of the materials to be used in connection with the development hereby permitted have been submitted to, approved in writing by and implemented in accordance with the requirements of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to retain control over the external appearance of the development and in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

4. Notwithstanding the amended application drawings additional information and details shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Planning Authority prior to commencement of this part of the works;

- a) Detailed Schedule of Repairs for the Listed Building, including its side extension
- b) Fully annotated and dimensioned detailed plan, front elevation and cross-section through the proposed re-located main entrance to the Listed Building, showing proposed steps, balustrade, threshold, front door, and decorative fanlight above set within its archway, illustrating detail design, architectural features, facing materials, and finishes, at a scale of 1:10.
- c) Fully annotated and dimensioned detailed plan, elevation, and cross-section, showing the proposed main front pedestrian gate through the Listed Building to the rear of site, illustrating detail design, architectural features, facing materials, and finishes, at a scale of 1:10.
- d) Fully annotated and dimensioned detailed plan, elevation, and cross-section of the proposed new rear dormer window on the roof of the Listed Building, illustrating detail design, architectural features, facing materials, and finishes, at a scale of 1:10.
- e) Fully annotated and dimensioned roof repair details to chimney stack, chimney pots, flashings, parapet wall, cornice, eaves, illustrating architectural features, facing materials, and finishes, at a scale of 1:10.
- f) Fully annotated and dimensioned detailed plan, elevation, and cross-section of the proposed new conservatory at the rear ground floor of the Listed Building.
- g) Details showing the re-location of the dedication stone on the front elevation of the side extension to the Listed Building.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building

5. All new external and internal works and finishes and works of making good to the retained fabric, shall match the existing with regard to the methods used and to material, colour, texture and profile, unless shown otherwise on the drawings or other documentation hereby approved or required by any conditions attached to this consent.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building

6. Notwithstanding any indication on the submitted drawings, details of the siting and design of all walls, gates, fencing, railings or other means of enclosure shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to the commencement of the development. The walls/gates/fencing/railings/enclosures shall be erected in accordance with the approved details following completion and occupation of the building hereby approved.

Reason: In order to retain control over the external appearance of the development and in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

CONSTRUCTION

7. The construction works of the development hereby granted shall not be carried out before 0800 or after 1800 hours Monday to Friday or before 0800 or after 1300 hours on Saturday and not at all on Sundays or Bank Holidays.

Reason: In order to ensure that the proposal does not prejudice the enjoyment of neighbouring occupiers of their properties.

8. The contractor on site shall ensure that all due care is taken to protect the historic fabric of the Listed Building from damage during the course of the works, including any materials, or elements of structure, that may be temporarily taken down and put to one side, and afterwards re-erected as part of the repair and reinstatement works.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building

9. Before any work is undertaken in pursuance of this consent to demolish or to alter by way of partial demolition any part of the building, structural engineers' drawings / method statement, indicating the proposed method of ensuring the safety and stability of the building fabric to be retained throughout the period of demolition and reconstruction, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority. The relevant work shall be carried out in accordance with such structural engineers' drawings / method statement thus approved.

Reason: To safeguard the historic fabric and the architectural character and appearance of this Listed Building

REASONS FOR APPROVAL

The development at the rear of the site is considered necessary to enable and to secure the proper repair, restoration and long term future of the Listed Building. The siting, design, form, detailing of the terrace block and associated landscaping to the rear of the site have been designed sensitively in terms of its relationship with the Listed Building. Overall the

proposed development will restore and enhance the appearance of the Listed Building and will preserve and enhance the character and appearance of this part of the Conservation Area. As such the proposal accords with policies CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV4 'Alteration and Extensions to Listed Buildings', CSV5 'Alteration and Extensions in Conservation Areas' and SPG2 'Conservation & Archaeology'.