

REPORT FOR CONSIDERATION AT PLANNING COMMITTEE

Reference No: HGY/2010/1175	Ward: Highgate
Address: Furnival House, 50 Cholmeley Park N6 5EW	
<p>Proposal: Application for a new planning permission to replace an extant planning permission HGY/2008/1432 for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities, 11 car parking spaces in basement area and four parking spaces externally, and 15 cycle spaces. Refuse/recycling facilities and associated landscaping.</p>	
Existing Use: C2	Proposed Use: C3
Applicant: Rozbelle Ltd	
Ownership: Private	
Date received: 24/06/2010	Last amended date:
<p>Drawing number of plans: 646-L-1.001, 002, 003; 646-L-2.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 006A, 007A, 008A, 010, 011, 012, 013, 014, 015, 020A, 021A, 022A, 023A, 024A, 025; 646-L-3.001A, 002A, 010; 646-L-4.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 010, 020, 021, 022, 023; 646-L-5.001, 002, 003 as varied by the amended drawings.</p>	
Case Officer Contact: Valerie Okeiyi	
PLANNING DESIGNATIONS: Road Network: B Road, Conservation Area, Listed Building – Grade II	
RECOMMENDATION: GRANT PERMISSION TO REPLACE EXTANT PLANNING PERMISSION LPA REF HGY/2008/1432	
<p>SUMMARY OF REPORT: This application is to replace an extant planning permission LPA Ref: HGY/2008/1432. The proposed application is considered acceptable and recommended for approved on the grounds that since the approval of the previous application there has been no overriding change in planning policy or no new material considerations to take account of. The proposed extensions and associated alterations with the conversion of this building as well as the mix and size of residents units are considered acceptable.</p>	

1. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

- 1.1 The site is open on its north-west elevation where there is open land that we believe is associated with the adjacent Harington Scheme horticultural building. To the north of the site are a number of large residential properties on the road named Parklands and to the east a terrace of houses / flats. To the south on the opposite side of the road is open land and tennis courts and to the south-west is the single residence of Kempton House and beyond that the large block of flats that is Cholmeley Lodge.
- 1.2 Cholmeley Park is a single carriageway road approximately 7.5m in width that has pavements of varying widths. A mix of building styles set back behind trees and hedges bound the road
- 1.3 Furnival House is an existing large four storey building with a symmetrical Edwardian Baroque façade with a part semi-basement level. The building is institutional in character and visually prominent in its garden setting when viewed from Cholmeley Park. The building is currently used by the University of Westminster as halls of residence and was originally built by the Prudential Insurance Company as female staff accommodation. It stands alone amongst well-stocked landscaped grounds. The building has a 'U' planform above ground floor level, with the open end of the U facing to the rear.
- 1.4 The building is predominantly of red brick construction with faience detailing to strings, quoins, copings and entrance details. Two later addition utilitarian metal staircases are located on the rear of the building that detract greatly from the general quality of the structure. The entrance hall has good flooring and embellishment to the entrance areas where building dates are noted. A very poor later addition lift has been inserted in the entrance hall approach. Internally the only other features of note are four circular rooflights, the detailing of which will be retained.
- 1.5 The site is within the designated Highgate Conservation Area and also forms part of the Highgate Bowl. Furnival House was recently listed as a grade two listed building on the 7th of October 2008. There are no TPO trees on the site.

2. PLANNING HISTORY

HGY/1991/1057-Display of two 10 x 8 sale boards- Approved 23-12-91

HGY/1992/1035-Dismantling and reconstruction of existing gateway arrangement to facilitate widened access road –Approved 22-12-92

HGY/1992/1039--Alteration to external elevation including amendment to windows and doors.- Approved GTD-20-10-92

HGY/1992/1040--Construction of brick clad water tank enclosures on existing flat roof – Approved GTD-20-10-92

HGY/1992/1076--Replacement of two open, non - enclosed steel fire escape staircase with two new open, non-enclosed steel fire escape staircase - GTD-20-10-92

HGY/1992/1364- Formation of a grasscrete road - GTD-10-05-93

HGY/1993/0035-Details of materials pursuant to conditions 3 & 4 attached to planning permission HGY/45585 – Approved 09-02-93

HGY/1995/1343- Tennis court site Furnival House Cholmeley Park London - Display of one advertisement at entrance to site. – Approved 21-05-96

OLD/1988/0226- Erection of extension to existing glass house new changing rooms, workspace and offices – Approved 08-12-88

HGY/2008/1432- Change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising of 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities, 11 car parking spaces in basement area and four parking spaces externally, 15 cycle spaces. Refuse/re-cycling facilities and associated landscaping. (Revised Description) – Approved GTD-08-12-08

HGY/2008/2021- Listed Building Consent for change of use from hostel to residential (C3) and conversion of property into 15 residential units comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats that will include erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and replacement top floor structure to create new unit. Excavation of lower ground floor and new basement to accommodate leisure facilities, 11 car parking spaces in basement area and four parking spaces externally, and 15 cycle spaces. Refuse / re-cycling facilities and associated landscaping – Approved 08-12-08

3. RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

3.1 National Planning Policy

Planning Policy Statement 1: Delivering Sustainable Development
Planning Policy Statement 3: Housing
Planning Policy Statement 5: Planning and the historic environment

3.2 London Plan

Policy 3A.1 Increasing London's supply of housing
Policy 3A.2 Borough housing targets
Policy 3A.3 Efficient use of stock
Policy 3A.4 Housing choice

Policy 3A.8 Negotiating affordable housing in individual private residential and mixed-use schemes
 Policy 4B.3 Maximising the potential of sites
 Policy 4B.6 Sustainable design and construction
 Policy 4C.21 Design statements
 Policy 6A.5 Planning obligations

3.3 Unitary Development Plan

G2 Development and Urban Design
 UDI Planning Statements
 UD2 Sustainable Design and Construction
 UD3 General Principles
 UD4 Quality Design
 UD7 Waste Storage
 M10 Parking for Development
 CSV1 Development in Conservation Areas
 CSV5 Alterations and Extensions in Conservation Areas
 CSV2 Listed Building
 CSV4 Alterations and Extensions to Listed Buildings
 CSV7 Demolition in Conservation Areas
 HSG1 New Housing Development
 HSG2 Change of Use to Residential
 HSG4 Affordable Housing
 HSG9 Density Standards
 HSG10 Dwelling Mix
 M10 Parking for Development

3.4 Supplementary Planning Guidance / Documents

SPG1a Design Guidance and Design Statements
 Housing SPD 2008
 SPG2 Conservation and Archaeology
 SPG7a Parking Standards
 SPG8b Materials
 SPG10 The Negotiation, Management and Monitoring of Planning Obligations
 SPG 10b Affordable Housing
 SPG 12 Educational Needs Generated by New Housing Development
 SPG 3.5 - Highgate Bowl – in Highgate Conservation Area (1999)

4. CONSULTATION

Statutory	Internal	External
English Heritage	Ward Councillors Conservation Team	<u>Amenity Groups</u> Highgate CAAC The Highgate Society <u>Local Residents</u>

		46 Cholmeley Park 1-21 © Parklands, Cholmeley Park 12a Parklands, Cholmeley Parklands Flat 1-6 © Kempton House, Cholmeley Park 55a Cholmeley Park Flat 1-9 © 55 Cholmeley Park Flat 1-8 © Elm Court, Cholmeley Park 53 Cholmeley Park 51 Cholmeley Park 8-14 (e) Winchester Place 1-6 © Dukes Head Yard
--	--	---

5. RESPONSES

Transportation

- 5.1 With regard to the above [planning application, the scheme is the same that was granted planning permission on the 23/01/09 and as such the previous Transportation and highways comments still stand.
- 5.2 This site is located in an area with medium public transport accessibility level and within a walking distance of the bus route Highgate High street which offers some 40buses (two-way), to connect with the nearby Archway tube station. We have subsequently considered that the majority of the prospective residents of this development would use sustainable travel modes for their journeys to and from this site. In addition, even without discounting the traffic resulting from the existing hostel use, our interrogation with TRAVL database has indicated that this development, some 4046sqm GFA, would generate some 15 and 8 vehicle movements (in/out of this development combined) during the morning and evening peak hours respectively, using comparable sites (Albion Wharf-SW11, Frazer Close - RM1, Parliament Square-SE1, Watergardens-SM1) as the basis for assessment. These forecasted vehicle movements are more than twice those predicted by the applicant's consultants Ardent Consulting Engineers who used TRICS database instead of the recommended TRAVL data.
- 5.3 Moreover, notwithstanding that this development is within the Archway Road Restricted Conversion Area (Policy HSG11), an area which suffers from heavy on-street parking pressure, the applicant has proposed 15 car parking spaces, including 2 disabled bays and, 15 bicycle racks which shall be enclosed under a secure shelter, as indicated on the Basement Floor Plan No.646-2.00 and in line with the parking standard stated in Appendix 1 of the UDP. There is also

the presence of Highgate Hill controlled parking zone which controls on-street car parking at this location and operates from Monday to Friday between 1000hrs and 1200 noon. It is therefore deemed that this development proposal would not have any significant adverse impact on the existing traffic or indeed car parking demand on the adjoining roads. Furthermore, the characteristics of this site fulfil the criteria set up in the UDP Policy M9, for dedication as a car-free development.

5.4 The applicant is also retaining the existing access arrangement which enables vehicles including refuse and emergency vehicles to enter and leave the site in forward gear. However, there is the concern with the lack of footway on the western side of the stretch of Cholmeley Park fronting this development. Hence we will ask the applicant to make a financial contribution towards the construction of a footway on this side. It is estimated that the cost of the associated works and/or providing alternative walking improvement measures would be in the region of £60,000 (sixty thousand pounds).

5.5 Consequently, the highway and transportation authority would not object to this application.

English Heritage Advice

5.6 Authorize that Haringey Council to determine the application for listed building consent and in doing so stress that they are not expressing any views on the merits of the proposals which are subject to the application.

Highgate CAAC

5.7 Object, because no plans are provided

Highgate Society

5.8 Oppose the renewal of consent in respect of the construction of an additional roof storey, and infill works, for the same reasons and concerns namely; because

- there will be a loss of privacy at present enjoyed in the nearby listed residences at Cholmeley Lodge, and Elizabeth House, and in the Highgate Bowl;
- the construction of basement leisure facilities may cause adverse effect upon the subground hydrology within the Highgate Bowl and other properties in the Highgate conservation area.
- the proposals will cause encroachment upon existing unbuilt areas on the Furnival House site.
- the proposed formation of an additional floor of residential accommodation will either enhance the character of the conservation area or protect the Listed Status of the building, but put its status at risk.

The Society objects to renewal of this consent, and recommends that the opportunity be taken to correct what was, we believe a poor decision.

Ward Councillor - Cllr Rachel Allison

- 5.9 Is inquiring that as well as a renewal for listed building consent there should also be the renewal of the planning permission for Furnival House.

Local Residents

- 5.10 Letters of objection received from have been received from the residents of No's 12a, 14 & 15 Parklands; 1 Kempton House and 23 Cholmeley Park and are outlined below:

- Lack of parking will lead to more parking pressures on the road
- They are concerned with length of the time the building works will take, noise levels, vehicles parked on the site and access to the garage at Kempton House
- There is concerns with the extent of the excavation that could result in physical damage to and deterioration of the fabric of the building.
- An engineer report should be submitted to the local authority and approved before any work can commence
- The development will constitute overdevelopment, which would have an extremely negative impact on the character, appearance and amenities of the areas
- The development would be detrimental to the privacy and amenity of nearby homes.
- The proposal would cause traffic conflict
- The developers have not provided a geological, engineering or any form of report to demonstrate whether or not such a large scale excavation is likely to have an effect on other properties in the vicinity

6. ANALYSIS / ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICATION

- 6.1 This application follows on from a previous approval for change of use from the hostel use to residential (C3) with the conversion of building into 15 residential units; comprising 6 x 3 bed, 7 x 2 bed and 2 x 1 bed flats. The previous proposal also included the erection of two storey rear stepped infill extension and creation of a top floor structure as well as excavation of the lower ground floor and creation of a new basement floor to accommodate leisure facilities and 11 car parking spaces. The current application is in effect a renewal of this consent. The details assessment associated with planning reference LPA Ref: HGY/2008/1432 is attached to this report. Since the approval of this previous application there have been no overriding changes to planning policy or new material considerations to take account of.

- 6.2 As set out in the Officers report accompanying LPA Ref: HGY/2008/1432 the principle of the conversion is considered acceptable and the internal alterations required will preserve the main reception rooms to the building. The

footprint of the building will remain the same and the extensions including the basement in relation to their scale, style and design will not be detrimental to the character and appearance of the building and the contribution it makes to the character and appearance of this part of the conservation area. The proposed fourth floor and second/third floor stepped infill extensions will be well set back and therefore will not be detrimental to the appearance of the building. The face of the building will be cleaned repaired and restored.

- 6.3 The removal of the unsightly staircase to the back of the building will further enhance the building and the preservation of the walls, arches and gate and restoration of the entrance hall will preserve the character of the building. Overall the scheme has been designed sensitively to minimise overlooking/loss of privacy of neighbouring occupiers.
- 6.4 All of the unit sizes and room sizes are consistent with the floor space minima identified in the Housing SPD 2008. On balance the proposed mix is considered acceptable. In terms of affordable housing a commuted sum is to be paid in lieu of the non provision of affordable units on site. This money can be used by the Council to assist in providing affordable housing at another site. The highways and transportation authority does not object to this application subject to a Section 106 Agreement.
- 6.5 The proposed development is therefore considered to be in accordance with Policies UD2 'Sustainable Design and Construction', UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', UD7 'Waste Storage', M10 'Parking for Development', CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV5 'Alterations and Extensions in Conservation Areas', HSG2 'Change of Use to Residential', HSG4 'Affordable Housing', HSG 10 'Dwelling Mix', HSG1 'New Housing Developments' and the Councils SPG1a 'Design Guidance and Design Statements', 'Housing SPD 2008, SPG2 'Conservation and Archaeology', SPG3b 'Privacy / Overlooking, Aspect / Outlook and Daylight / Sunlight', SPG7a 'Parking Standards', SPG10a 'The Negotiation, Management and Monitoring of Planning Obligations', SPG 10b 'Affordable Housing' and SPG 10c 'Educational Needs Generated by New Housing Development' of the Haringey Unitary Development Plan.

7. RECOMMENDATION

The Sub-Committee is recommended to RESOLVE to grant permission to replace extant planning permission LPA Ref: HGY/2008/1432 with HGY/2010/1175 subject to the conditions attached to this previous consent (as set out below) continuing to apply in all respects other than as modified by the approval of this planning permission and subject to the Section 106 agreement attached to this previous consent also continuing to apply other than any variation to Section 106 agreement considered necessary by the Council's Legal Department

Applicant's drawing No.(s) 646-L-1.001, 002, 003; 646-L-2.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 006A, 007A, 008A, 010, 011, 012, 013, 014, 015, 020A, 021A,

022A, 023A, 024A, 025; 646-L-3.001A, 002A, 010; 646-L-4.001A, 002A, 003A, 004A, 005A, 010, 020, 021, 022, 023; 646-L-5.001, 002, 003 as varied by the amended drawings.

Subject to the following conditions

1. The development hereby authorised must be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission, failing which the permission shall be of no effect.

Reason: This condition is imposed by virtue of the provisions of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and to prevent the accumulation of unimplemented planning permissions.

2. The development hereby authorised shall be carried out in complete accordance with the plans and specifications submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details and in the interests of amenity.

3. Samples of all materials to be used for the external surfaces of the development shall be submitted to, and approved in writing by, the Local Planning Authority before any development is commenced. Samples should include sample panels or brick types and a roofing material sample combined with a schedule of the exact product references.

Reason: In order for the Local Planning Authority to retain control over the exact materials to be used for the proposed development and to assess the suitability of the samples submitted in the interests of visual amenity.

4. A scheme for the treatment of the surroundings of the proposed development including the planting of trees and/or shrubs shall be submitted to, approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority, and implemented in accordance with the approved details.

Reason: In order to provide a suitable setting for the proposed development in the interests of visual amenity.

5. Details of a scheme depicting those areas to be treated by means of hard landscaping shall be submitted to, approved in writing by, and implemented in accordance with the approved details. Such a scheme to include a detailed drawing of those areas of the development to be so treated, a schedule of proposed materials and samples to be submitted for written approval on request from the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to ensure the development has satisfactory landscaped areas in the interests of the visual amenity of the area.

6. The works hereby approved shall be carried out to the satisfaction of the Council's Arboriculturalist acting on behalf of the Local Planning Authority to include the following provisions: New replacement specimens of a similar type to those trees to be removed.

Reason: In order for the works to be supervised by the Council's Arboriculturalist to ensure satisfactory tree practice in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

7. The construction works of the development hereby granted shall not be carried out before 0800 or after 1800 hours Monday to Friday or before 0800 or after 1200 hours on Saturday and not at all on Sundays or Bank Holidays.

Reason: In order to ensure that the proposal does not prejudice the enjoyment of neighbouring occupiers of their properties.

8. Not less than three months before the commencement of development, a method statement with drawings at a scale of not less than 1:200 showing:

(a) construction details for the proposed basement excavation and
(b) measures to deal with the groundwater on the site, and its immediate surroundings shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority. The method statement is to be approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of the development, such approval not to be unreasonably withheld.

Reason: In order that the Council may be satisfied as to the potential effects of the basement construction both on the existing building fabric, and on the local hydrogeology.

9. The applicants submits details of the routing/management of the construction traffic to the transportation planning team, for approval.

Reason: To minimise the impact of the movements of the associated construction vehicles, on the adjoining roads.

10. Details of provision for recycling and refuse storage on the site should be submitted and approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to ensure a satisfactory appearance to the building and to safeguard the enjoyment by neighbouring occupiers of their properties and the appearance of the locality.

11. Surface water drainage works and source control measures shall be carried out in accordance with details which have been submitted to and approved in writing by the local planning authority before development commences.

Reason: To prevent the increased risk of flooding.

12. The proposed development shall have a central dish/aerial system for receiving all broadcasts for all the residential units created, details of such a scheme shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to the occupation of the property and the approved scheme shall be implemented and permanently retained thereafter.

Reason: In order to protect the visual amenities of the neighbourhood.

13. No development shall commence until 2) and 3) below are carried out to the approval of London Borough of Haringey.

1. The Applicant will submit a site-wide energy strategy for the proposed development. This strategy must meet the following criteria:

2. (a) Inclusion of a site-wide energy use assessment showing projected annual demands for thermal (including heating and cooling) and electrical energy, based on contemporaneous building regulations minimum standards. The assessment must show the carbon emissions resulting from the projected energy consumption.

- (b) The assessment should demonstrate that the proposed heating and cooling systems have been selected in accordance with the following order of preference: passive design; solar water heating; combined heat and power for heating and cooling, preferably fuelled by renewables; community heating for heating and cooling; heat pumps; gas condensing boilers and gas central heating. The strategy should examine the potential use of CHP to supply thermal and electrical energy to the site. Resulting carbon savings to be calculated.

- (c) Inclusion of onsite renewable energy generation to reduce the remaining carbon emissions (i.e. after (a) is accounted for) by 10% subject to feasibility studies carried out to the approval of LB Haringey.

3. All reserved matters applications must contain an energy statement demonstrating consistency with the site wide energy strategy developed in 2). Consistency to be approved by LB Haringey prior to the commencement of development.

Reason: To ensure the development incorporates energy efficiency measures including on-site renewable energy generation, in order to contribute to a reduction in Carbon Dioxide Emissions generated by the development in line with national and local policy guidance.

14. That the levels of all thresholds and details of boundary treatment be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to safeguard the visual amenity of the area and to ensure adequate means of enclosure for the proposed development.

15. The applicant must provide an Arboricultural Method Statement (AMS) and Tree Protection Plan (TPP) for approval. This is a requirement of BS 5837: 2005 Trees in relation to construction. The AMS must cover all works that impact on trees, including the proposed new footpath to be installed east of the building.

The TPP must include a specification for protective fencing and ground protection where necessary. It must also identify the location of site buildings, storage areas, and areas where building materials will be mixed.

Reason: In order to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details and the interests of the amenity.

INFORMATIVE: The applicant is advised that in the interests of the security of the development hereby authorised that all works should comply with BS 8220 (1986), Part 1 - 'Security Of Residential Buildings'.

INFORMATIVE: The new development will require naming / numbering. The applicant should contact the Transportation Group at least six weeks before the development is occupied (tel. 020 8489 5573) to arrange for the allocation of a suitable address.

INFORMATIVE: - In regards to surface water drainage Thames Water point out that it is the responsibility of the developer to make proper provision for drainage to ground, water courses or surface water sewer. It must not be allowed to drain to the foul sewer as this is the major contributor to sewer flooding. Thames Water recognises the environmental and economic benefits of surface water source control and encourages its appropriate application where it is to the overall benefit of our customers. Hence, in the disposal of surface water, Thames Water will recommend that the Applicant:

- a) Looks to ensure that new connections to the public sewerage system do not pose an unacceptable threat of surcharge, flooding or pollution,
- b) check the proposals are in line with advice from the DETR which encourages, wherever practicable, disposal on site without recourse to the public sewerage system - for example in the form of soakaways or infiltration areas on free draining soils and
- c) looks to ensure the separation of foul and surface water sewerage on all new developments.

INFORMATIVE: Pursuant to Condition 3 above, details of materials should include proposals for the repair / retention of existing windows and the provision of secondary double glazing; or new timber-framed double glazed units to match the existing windows.

INFORMATIVE: Pursuant to Condition 4 above, details of boundary treatment should show

- (a) the refurbishment / repair of the front boundary wall, and
- (b) replacement of the existing timber fence on the south western side of the building adjacent to the access road, with alternative methods of enclosure or hedge planting.

REASONS FOR APPROVAL

This application for a new planning permission to replace an extant planning permission HGY/2008/1432 should be approved on the grounds that since the approval of this application there has been no overriding change in the Council's policy position or no new material considerations to take account of. The proposed is still therefore considered to be in accordance with Policies UD2 'Sustainable Design and Construction', UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', UD7 'Waste Storage', M10 'Parking for Development', CSV1 'Development in Conservation Areas', CSV5 'Alterations and Extensions in Conservation Areas', HSG2 'Change of Use to Residential', HSG4 'Affordable Housing', HSG 10 'Dwelling Mix', HSG1 'New Housing Developments' and the Councils SPG1a 'Design Guidance and Design Statements, 'Housing SPD 2008, SPG2 'Conservation and Archaeology', SPG7a 'Parking Standards', SPG10a 'The Negotiation, Management and Monitoring of Planning Obligations', SPG 10b 'Affordable Housing' and SPG 10c 'Educational Needs Generated by New Housing Development' of the Haringey Unitary Development Plan.