

Planning Committee 13 July 2009

Item No.

REPORT FOR CONSIDERATION AT PLANNING COMMITTEE

Reference No: HGY/2009/0659

Ward: Fortis Green

Date received: 17/04/2009

Last amended date: N / A

Drawing number of plans: 002 P1, 003 P1, 004 P1, 005 P1, 100 P1, 101 P1, 102 P1, 103 P2, 104 P1, 200 P2, 201 P2, 300 P2 & 301 P2.

Address: Fortismere School North Wing, Creighton Avenue, N10

Proposal: Demolition of existing music teaching rooms and two temporary buildings and erection of new music teaching faculty.

Existing Use: Education

Proposed Use: Education

Applicant: Mr Simon Briddon, Haringey Council - Children and Families

Ownership: Public

PLANNING DESIGNATIONS

Road Network: Classified Road

Officer Contact: Robin Campbell

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PERMISSION subject to conditions.

SITE AND SURROUNDINGS

Fortismere School is made up of north and south wings, each of which was originally a separate school before they merged in the 1960's. The key aspect of the development relates to the north wing, which is located on the south side of Creighton Avenue and to the west of Eastwood Road. The development site within the north wing is bounded to the east by residential properties, to the west by Block A of the school, beyond which is a treed strip of land and beyond that is Ringwood Avenue, which is a residential street. To the south of the north wing development site is the school tennis courts and playing fields. The School is not within a Conservation Area.

PLANNING HISTORY

HGY/1997/0930 - Erection of single storey technology block – Granted, 22/09/97.

HGY/1999/1634 - Erection of new detached block at ground/lower ground floor level to facilitate 7 classrooms, staff room, early years, speech and language audiology, plant, office services, meeting, administration, reprograph, head and deputy heads rooms, with lift and associated entrance lobby – Granted, 28/04/00.

HGY/2000/0670 - Erection of new sports hall building. Provision of 50 car parking spaces for Tetherdown. Erection of second floor bridge link to south block and associated alterations to entrance area – Granted, 09/08/00.

HGY/2002/1643 - Details of materials; control of access at Burlington road; Parking : Planting and levels pursuant to conditions 04,07,09,10 and 14 relating to planning permission HGY/057698 – Granted, 21/12/04.

HGY/2004/2214 - Erection of canopy to walkway linking North and South wings of school (Phases 1 & 2) – Granted, 07/12/04.

DETAILS OF PROPOSAL

Demolition of existing music teaching rooms and two temporary buildings and erection of new music teaching faculty, comprising a part three storey / part four storey block, adjacent to the existing North Wing.

CONSULTATION

Neighbour Notification

24 – 50 (even) Ringwood Avenue, N2
67 – 77 (odd), 72 – 98 (even) Crighton Avenue, N2
19, 24 Eastwood Road, N10
The Lodge, Creighton Avenue, N10
62 – 70 (even) Creighton Avenue, N10
20, 22, 15, 17 Eastwood Road, N10
92-98 (even) Creighton Avenue, N10
14-22 (even) Ringwood Avenue, N2
77A Creighton Avenue, N10
11, 14, 16 Burlington Road, N10
GG/FF – 14, 16 Burlington Road, N10
5, 5A, 7, 7A Tetherdown, N10
15-27 (odd) Tetherdown, N10

Internal / External Consultation

Ward Councillors
LBH Conservation and Design

RESPONSES

2 written objections have been received in relation to the proposed development. In addition, 3 comments have been received, including one from Muswell Hill and Fortis Green Association. The grounds of objection and comments are summarised below:

- Environmental impact: too large / high, shall have a detrimental visual impact;
- Detrimental impact on character and appearance of the area as well as the landscape;
- Height and massing would be out of character with the street scene;
- Concern over noise disturbance and loss / damage to trees;
- Concerns over the end use of the site which is occupied by the existing music rooms.

RELEVANT PLANNING POLICY

Haringey UDP (2006)

G1 Environment
G2 Development and Urban Design
G7 Green Belt, MOL and Green Chains
G9 Community Well Being
UD2 Sustainable Design and Construction
UD3 General Principles
UD4 Quality Design
M3 New Development Location and Accessibility
M4 Pedestrians and Cyclists
M10 Parking and Development
OS2 Metropolitan Open Land
OS5 Development Adjacent to Open Spaces
OS6 Ecologically valuable sites and their corridors
OS11 Biodiversity
OS17 Tree Protection, Tree Masses and Spines
CW1 New Community / Health Facilities
Policy ENV9 Mitigating Climate Change: Energy Efficiency
Policy ENV10 Mitigating Climate Change: Renewable Energy

Supplementary Planning Guidance

SPG1a Design Guidance

ANALYSIS/ASSESSMENT OF THE APPLICATION

This application seeks planning permission for improvements to Fortismere School, specifically the demolition of the existing music teaching buildings adjacent to the south wing and the development of a new music teaching facility within the north wing. Fortismere School is a mixed comprehensive school providing spaces for up to 1,715 pupils aged 11 to 18. The existing music and drama facilities are within prefabricated buildings and are understood to be outdated and not fit for purpose. No increase in the

school's capacity would be created as a result of the proposed development, with the aim being to improve facilities for the existing school roll.

The proposed development consists of the following:

- The demolition of two existing temporary music classrooms (Blocks G and I) in the south wing, with this area to be landscaped;
- The demolition of an existing single-storey wing of the former gymnasium in the north wing of the school and replaced by a new music facility, part 3 / part 4 storey, with a skybridge link to the adjacent teaching block A. This shall result in the creation of 814 sqm of new floorspace. Four music teaching rooms will be provided as well as a music technology room and practice rooms.

The key Issues for consideration are as follows:

- 1) Principle of Development;
- 2) Impact of additional buildings on nearby housing and adjacent MOL;
- 3) Access / Parking
- 4) Design and materials of new buildings;
- 5) Landscaping / trees;
- 6) Sustainability / Energy Efficiency.

1) Principle of Development

Policy CW1 (New Community / Health Facilities) of the Haringey UDP 2006 supports the development of new community facilities in appropriate locations, where there is a local need, where it is accessible and where it can be used for more than one community purpose.

The site is in existing educational (High School) use, therefore, the principle of this use is established in this location. It is considered the need for the new music facility has been demonstrated through the existing provision being out dated and not fit for purpose. The site has no specific development allocation within the Haringey UDP 2006, therefore, the principle of the proposal is considered to be acceptable.

2) Impact of development on nearby residential properties and adjacent MOL

Residential Amenity

South Wing

The proposed demolition of Blocks G and I will most likely have a beneficial impact on the residential properties which front onto Tetherdown and which back on to the school, as once demolished, these areas are proposed to be landscaped. As such, there are no issues anticipated with this aspect of the proposed development.

North Wing

The closest residential properties to the proposed development at the north wing are those on Creighton Avenue, specifically no.77 and no.75. No.77 adjoins the north east boundary of the proposed development site, therefore, is in close proximity to it. The rear elevations of the properties on Ringwood Avenue are at least 130m to the west of the proposed development. Properties on Eastwood Road are at some distance to the east, are on an elevated level and are orientated away from the proposed development site.

In terms of impact on visual amenity, privacy and overlooking as well as general residential amenity, the following positions have been considered:

No.77 Creighton Avenue

This is the closest residential property to the proposed development. There is a significant amount of screening between the west boundary of no.77 Creighton Avenue and the development site. There are three mature oak trees (approx 15m) on the east boundary of the north wing site, which adjoin the garden ground of no.77 Creighton Avenue.

The section of the proposed development closest to the boundary with no.77 Creighton is 3 storey in height (11.7m) and is a distance of 15m from the boundary with no.77. The proposed development shall be visible from the garden ground of no.77 primarily during winter months. Outwith this time, the three mature oak trees within the school site and the additional vegetation within the garden ground of no.77 shall provide effective screening.

In terms of potential overshadowing, the proposed development is to the west of no.77 and is not directly adjacent to the garden ground of no.77. As such, although there is the potential for some loss of sunlight / daylight from the garden ground of no.77, this would not be significant and would not be considered to result in unreasonable overshadowing or loss of light at this property.

In terms of privacy, the east facing section of the proposed development is relatively narrow and only contains 3 x clear glazed panels, one each at ground, first and second floors, which are part of a general circulation area and have the following dimensions; 1m wide x 3m high. As such, there is very limited prospect for direct overlooking of the garden ground of no.77, particularly taking into account the existing screening which is in place between the two properties. As such, there is no unreasonable overlooking anticipated at no.77.

Taking into account the nature of use of the proposed building, the potential for noise disturbance has to be considered. Being the closest residential property to the proposal, no.77 is the most likely to suffer from noise disturbance, should there be any. The applicant has proposed to install acoustically sealed double glazing throughout with mechanical ventilation to limit noise escaping from the building. This is proposed to be in accordance with Building Bulletin 93 – School Acoustics. This, taking into account the fact that the building shall only be in use during the day (when background noise levels are higher), is considered acceptable in terms of ensuring there are limited levels of audible noise leaving the building.

Ringwood Avenue

The rear elevations of the properties to the west on Ringwood Avenue shall be at least 130m from the west elevation of the proposed development. There is a significant amount of trees and vegetation between the properties on Ringwood Avenue and also several existing school buildings, in particular, Block A. Block A is a two storey building and the highest point of the proposed music facility shall rise approx 5.6m above it. Although the proposal may well be visible from the upper levels of the properties on the east side of Ringwood Avenue, due to the distance and the visual breaks in between, it is not considered there shall be a detrimental impact on the visual amenity or aspect of these properties.

Due to the distance from Ringwood Avenue to the proposed development, there is no issue in relation to overshadowing, loss of privacy or noise disturbance.

Eastwood Road

The closest property on Eastwood Road (no.24) shall be at least 80m from the east face of the proposed development. Again, there is a significant amount of existing trees between Eastwood Road and the proposed music facility, which shall act as effective screening for the properties on this street. In addition, the orientation of the properties on Eastwood Road does not lend itself to direct views to the proposed development at the north wing. These properties face north/south, whereas the proposed development is to the west. As such, it is not considered there shall be a detrimental impact on the visual amenity or aspect of these properties.

As with Ringwood, due to the distance from Eastwood Road to the proposed development, there is no issue in relation to overshadowing, loss of privacy or noise disturbance.

Metropolitan Open Land (MOL)

MOL is located approx 20m to the south of the proposed development at Fortismere School North Wing and is located on the west side of Block A, approx 60m to the west of the proposed development.

Policy OS5 (development adjacent to open spaces) relates to development close to existing designated MOL, identifying that development will only be permitted if it protects or enhances the value and visual character of the open land. In terms of the proposed music facility, a key concern relates to the potential dominance of the development and impact on views when viewed from the MOL, particularly when viewed from the south. The original proposal reads as 4 stories in height, irrespective of the use of the fourth level. As the majority of properties in the immediate vicinity are predominantly two / three storey, it is considered the fourth level shall not fit with the existing setting and context of the area. It is acknowledged that the proposed site is at a low point within the site, with the level falling significantly from the south wing, however, it is not considered this would entirely mitigate the overall height of the proposed building.

As a result of these concerns, the applicant has agreed to make alterations to the fourth level which shall contain the servicing, in order to reduce its height and bulk. This has resulted in the following:

- reduction in height of the north west section (containing servicing) from 14.35m to 12.2m, thereby minimising the servicing area;
- reduction in the overall maximum height of the building from 14.4m to 13.95m (to the roof of the stairwell enclosure).

As identified within the UDP, the boundary and any sense of enclosure created by adjacent development is a key component in defining the character of the open land and is important in defining views from and to the open land. Taking into account the proposed reduction in height of the north west section of the development, as well as the topography and screening of the site, it is considered the proposal shall not have a detrimental impact on the area of MOL to the south of the site. Although a section of the building shall remain at 14.35m, this is only a small section (stairwell enclosure) and shall not create the same bulk and mass as the north west section of the building would have. As such, it is accepted that the proposed development appropriately protects the value of the adjacent MOL and is considered consistent with policy OS5 'Development Adjacent to Open Spaces'.

3) Access / Parking (Vehicle / Cycle)

The proposed development must provide appropriate access for mainstream pupils and for those with special requirements. In terms of access, the proposed building shall have lift access to all floors. The proposed development shall be required to comply with the requisite Building Regulations and SPG4 'Access for All – Mobility Standards'.

The proposed development does not involve the provision of additional parking spaces. In addition, the purpose of the proposal is not to directly increase the capacity of the school, in terms of increasing the school roll or number of staff. As such, there are no specific planning or transportation issues associated with the proposed development.

During the construction period, it is understood that access for the construction vehicles shall be from Creighton Avenue. A small section of Block A shall be demolished to enable construction vehicles to enter the site without affecting the existing mature trees on the east boundary of the site. A Construction Management Plan shall be required to be submitted to the LPA and agreed prior to commencement of development.

As with the issue of vehicle parking, there are no additional cycle spaces proposed as there is no direct increase in pupils / staff anticipated through the proposed development.

4) Design and materials of new buildings

Design Policy UD4 of the Haringey UDP (2006) details the design requirements to be taken into

account in development proposals. The applicant has submitted revised proposals for consideration which are incorporated below.

The key dimensions of the overall building are as follows:

- Width: North elevation - 22.85m; South elevation – 14.3m;
- Depth: West Elevation – 18.55m; East elevation – 5.75m;
- Height: Max height of 14.25m (to skylight of stairwell enclosure); Predominant height 11.4m (main section) to 12.2m (revised north west section).

The proposed development consists of three distinct parts which are detailed below:

North West section

This was originally proposed to be a four storey section, however, through discussion with the applicant, the height of this section has been reduced. This section was originally proposed to stand at 14.35m in height, however, the revised height is 12.2m. The fourth level of this part of the building contains the servicing, therefore, it is only levels 1, 2 and 3 which shall contain useable space. The north west section shall consist of a brick plinth, with a mix of clear glazed panels and aluminium curtain walling (Silver Grey RAL) at levels 1, 2 and 3. The fourth level (servicing level) has been reduced in height and is considered should consist of a solid panel system to differentiate it from the levels below.

Main Section

This is a three storey section which stands at a height of 11.4m. This section shall consist of a brick plinth, white rendered walls with recessed elongated windows. There is a link bridge between the first floor of the main section and Block A to the west. The parapet shall consist of aluminium coping (Silver Grey RAL).

Stair Core

The stair enclosure also reads as a fourth storey element, rising to a height of 13.95m (14.25m at skylight). It is 5.9m wide and 4.8m deep. The stair enclosure shall consist of an aluminium grey cladding system.

Scale / Massing / Materials

The surrounding context of the development site is suburban in nature, with the surrounding school buildings being 2 stories in height. The highest element of the building shall be the stairwell enclosure. Through discussion with the applicant, the north west element of the building has been reduced in height resulting in its overall height being 12.2m. The fact that the building is sited on the lower part of the site is acknowledged as is the surrounding screening. The proposed alterations are considered to appropriately address the concerns in relation to height and mass of the north west element of the development.

Overall, the development is of a modern design, with a variety of different elevational treatments which shall create an element of visual interest. The proposed choice of materials is considered acceptable in relation to achieving an attractive and fit for purpose building. In terms of specific material colour, it is considered that this shall have to be controlled by condition.

5) Landscaping / Trees and Open

The proposed development does not involve the loss of any trees on the site. The three mature trees on the east boundary of the site shall require to be protected during the construction period. A Tree Protection Plan shall be required to be submitted to the Local Planning Authority, which shall be sought through a planning condition.

Landscaping is proposed at the south wing, where the existing temporary music buildings shall be demolished and at the north wing courtyard that adjoins the proposed extension. No specific landscape proposals have been submitted with the planning application, therefore, these details shall be sought through a planning condition.

6) Sustainability / Energy Efficiency / Biodiversity

Policy UD2 of Haringey UDP (2006) contains the Council's sustainability objectives. Policies ENV9 and ENV10 of the UDP relate to Energy Efficiency and Renewable Energy. The key objectives of Policy ENV9 are to encourage energy efficiency and to achieve a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions through new development. Policy 4A.7 of the London Plan identifies that development should achieve a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions of 20% from on site renewable energy generation unless it can be demonstrated that such provision is not feasible. A Sustainability Statement is contained within the Design and Access Statement submitted with the planning application. Although the applicant has not submitted an Energy Report, it is stated within the D&A Statement that the development would result in a 25% reduction in carbon dioxide emissions from the predicted levels. Demonstration of this shall be required through an Energy Report, identifying what on site renewable technology shall be utilised, which shall be sought through a planning condition.

The Sustainability Statement within the planning application details the measures put in place to achieve energy efficiency through the proposed development.

The applicant has identified their commitment to achieving a rating of 'very good' in a BREEAM Schools Assessment. As with the Energy Report, it is recommended that details of a BREEAM pre-assessment be submitted to the Local Planning Authority for consideration.

Noise

The acoustic performance of the building is identified as being in accordance with BRE: Building Bulletin 93. The use of mechanical ventilation is to be utilised in order to limit noise spillage from the building.

Daylight

It is considered the new build blocks will achieve suitable natural daylight access.

External Lighting

Lighting at doors is proposed for access and egress, however, the building shall not be illuminated externally, therefore, it is not considered there shall be any issues with light spillage to neighbouring properties.

Land Contamination

No Site Investigation information has been submitted with the planning application. Information shall be required through planning condition, to identify any potential areas of contamination within the site.

Waste Storage and Recycling

Policy UD7 (Waste Storage) requires new development to include appropriate provision for the storage and collection of waste and recyclable materials. Large developments are generally required to produce a Waste Management Plan.

As the proposed development involves an existing school use on the site, with existing waste management procedures, a Waste Management Plan shall not be required for the operation of the site.

It is considered that the above satisfies the requirements of Policy UD7.

Biodiversity

Policy OS11 of the UDP requires the protection and enhancement of biodiversity within the Borough. The Council encourages developments to enhance biodiversity within and close to buildings. It is considered that biodiversity enhancement measures should be included within the landscape proposals which are required through condition.

SUMMARY AND CONCLUSION

The proposal development will replace the existing out dated music facilities with a new music building facility, providing a purpose built facility for the school. This enhancement of community facilities is consistent with policy CW1 of the Haringey UDP (2006). Due to amendments made by the applicant to the fourth level (north west section), and taking into account the site levels and surrounding screening, it is considered the proposed scale, layout and siting of the proposed development shall not have a detrimental impact in spatial or visual terms on the character and setting of the site or on the adjacent MOL. The building is of a modern design, with contrasting materials which shall create an element of visual interest within the north wing and is considered appropriate in the context of the site and the surrounding area. Special consideration has been taken of the potential impact of development on the residents of no.77 and no.75 Creighton Avenue, however, it is considered the proposed development is of a sufficient design and siting to avoid any detrimental impact on the residential amenity of these properties in terms of loss of sunlight / daylight, loss of privacy and noise disturbance. There are no trees proposed for removal, however, the construction traffic shall be in close proximity to three mature oak trees on the east boundary, therefore, a Tree Protection Plan shall be required. In addition, a Construction Management Plan shall be required through condition which should address logistics and vehicle movement as well as waste management.

RECOMMENDATION

GRANT PERMISSION

Registered No. HGY/2009/0659

Applicant's drawing No.(s) 002 P1, 003 P1, 004 P1, 005 P1, 100 P1, 101 P1, 102 P1, 103 P2, 104 P1, 200 P2, 201 P2, 300 P2 & 301 P2.

Subject to the following condition(s)

TIMESCALE / PLANS

1. The development hereby authorised must be begun not later than the expiration of 3 years from the date of this permission, failing which the permission shall be of no effect.

Reason: This condition is imposed by virtue of the provisions of the Planning & Compulsory Purchase Act 2004 and to prevent the accumulation of unimplemented planning permissions.

2. The development hereby authorised shall be carried out in complete accordance with the plans and specifications submitted to, and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to ensure the development is carried out in accordance with the approved details and in the interests of amenity.

MATERIALS / LANDSCAPING / NATURE CONSERVATION

3. Notwithstanding the description of the materials in the application, no construction shall be commenced until precise details of the materials to be used in connection with the development hereby permitted have been submitted to, approved in writing by and implemented in accordance with the requirements of the Local Planning Authority.

Reason: In order to retain control over the external appearance of the development in the interest of the visual amenity of the area.

4. A detailed landscape plan and planting scheme for the proposed landscaped areas in the north and south wing shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of construction. The planting scheme shall be fully implemented by the end of the first planting season, after completion of the development.

Reason: In order to ensure appropriate landscaping is undertaken in the interest of biodiversity and visual amenity.

5. A Tree Protection Plan shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority prior to commencement of development, which shall include details of Root Protection Areas (RPA) and tree protection fencing must be erected as agreed within the Tree Protection Plan.

Reason: In order to ensure the safety and well being of the trees on the site during constructional works that are to remain after building works are completed.

6. A pre-commencement site meeting must take place with the Architect, the local authority Arboriculturist, Consulting Arboriculturist and the Construction Site Manager, to confirm the protective measures to be implemented, not less than 28 days prior to commencement of development.

Reason: In order to ensure the safety and well being of the trees on the site during constructional works that are to remain after building works are completed.

CONSTRUCTION PERIOD

7. The construction works of the development hereby granted shall not be carried out before 0730 or after 1830 hours Monday to Friday or before 0800 or after 1300 hours on Saturday and not at all on Sundays or Bank Holidays.

Reason: In order to ensure that the proposal does not prejudice the enjoyment of neighbouring occupiers of their properties.

8. Prior to the commencement of development a Construction Management Plan shall be submitted to and approved in writing by the Local Planning Authority. This shall include details of construction logistics, delivery service as well as demolition and associated waste management.

Reason: To ensure the construction period of the development does not result in unreasonable disturbance for neighbouring properties and to minimise vehicular conflict at this location.

SUSTAINABILITY / RENEWABLE ENERGY

9. Prior to occupation, details of energy efficient design and consideration of on-site equipment, to demonstrate at least a 20% reduction in carbon dioxide emissions from on-site renewable energy generation, shall be submitted to and approved by the Local Planning Authority and shall be implemented prior to the commencement of the use hereby permitted and maintained thereafter for the life of the development.

Reason: To ensure the development incorporates energy efficiency measures including on-site renewable energy generation, in order to contribute to a reduction in carbon dioxide emissions generated by the development in line with national and local policy guidance.

OTHER

10. A Land Contamination Assessment Report shall be submitted to the Local Planning Authority prior to construction works on site.

Reason: In order for the Local Planning Authority to ensure the site is contamination free.

REASONS FOR APPROVAL

By virtue of the nature of the proposed development it is considered consistent with Policy CW1 'New Community / Health Facilities' which encourages the provision of community facilities. The height and scale of the proposed development have been appropriately addressed to ensure there shall not be a detrimental impact on the spatial and visual character and setting of the surrounding area and adjacent MOL. The proposed siting and design are considered acceptable, and together with the existing screening shall ensure there is no unreasonable detrimental impact on the residential amenity of neighbouring properties in terms of terms of loss of sunlight / daylight, loss of privacy and noise disturbance. As such, the proposed development is considered consistent with Policies CW1 'New Community / Health Facilities', UD3 'General Principles', UD4 'Quality Design', OS5 'Development Adjacent to Open Spaces', as well as SPG1a 'Design Guidance' of Haringey UDP (2006).

This page is intentionally left blank